

Compiled Information on the Life and Works of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge and Bibliographical Resources

First published online: 15.09.2015.¹

Last update: 16.04.2024.

Please send additional information, corrections and emendations to pascale.hugon@oeaw.ac.at.

Table of contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 1. Biographical information | 2 |
| 1.1 Chronology | 2 |
| 1.2 Phya pa's teachers | 3 |
| 1.3 Phya pa's students | 4 |
| 1.4 Monks ordained by Phya pa..... | 5 |
| 1.5 Other information..... | 6 |
| 2. Writings of Phya pa..... | 8 |
| 2.1 Extant works | 8 |
| 2.1.a Chronology of the works | 12 |
| 2.2 Works attributed to Phya pa..... | 12 |
| 2.2.1 By himself..... | 12 |
| 2.2.2 By Bu ston rin chen grub (1290–1364) | 12 |
| 2.2.3 By 'Gos lo tsā ba gzhon nu dpal (1392–1481)..... | 12 |
| 2.2.4 By gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan (1428–1507)..... | 13 |
| gSer mdog paṅ chen - <i>dGa' byed</i> 12-13..... | 13 |
| gSer mdog paṅ chen - <i>dGa' byed</i> 32..... | 13 |
| 2.2.5 By A khu Rin po che Shes rab rgya mtsho (1803–1875)..... | 13 |
| A khu - <i>Tho yig</i> 637–677 | 13 |
| 3. Modern studies dealing with Phya pa, his life, his works, his ideas | 14 |
| 3.1 In English..... | 14 |
| 3.2 In French | 16 |
| 3.3 In Japanese | 16 |
| Bibliographical references | 18 |
| 1. Collections of texts, catalogues, etc..... | 18 |
| 2. Individual authors (ancient and modern) | 18 |

¹ The information in this document started being compiled by Pascale Hugon in the framework of the Project P23422-G15 "Early bKa' gdams pa scholasticism – Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's contribution" generously supported by the Austrian Science Fund (FWF) (August 2012-September 2017). I am grateful to (in alphabetical order) Kazuo Kano, Hiroshi Nemoto, Fumihito Nishizawa, Eric Werner and Jongbok Yi for their additional input.

1. Biographical information

In modern studies the majority of the available information on Phya pa (Phywa pa, Cha pa) has been provided in [van der Kuijp 1978](#) and [van der Kuijp 1983](#). Summaries of the available information are also found for instance in [Seyfort Ruegg 2000](#): 37–40, [Tauscher 2009–2010](#): 2–3 and [Hugon 2008a](#): 35–36 (in French).

A biography of Phya pa was reportedly composed by his student gTsang nag pa, but it is not extant.

[van der Kuijp 1978](#): 355: “The bibliography of A-khu Rin-po-che notes that one of his foremost disciples, gTsang-nag-pa brTson-'grus seng-ge was the author of his biography entitled, 'The biography of Phya pa Chos-kyi seng-ge, the diffusion of the light of confidence in a hundred regions' (*Phya-pa Chos-kyi seng-ge 'i rnam-thar dad-pa'i 'od-(g)zer phyogs-brgyar 'gyed-pa*).¹(Cf. his 'tho-yig' reprinted in *Materials of a History of Tibetan Literature*, Part 3, ed. L. Chandra, New Delhi, 1963, p. 507)”

The eulogy composed by Phya pa's student bSod nams rtse mo ([bSod nams rtse mo – bsTod pa](#)) stresses his intellectual capacities but does not provide chronological information apart from the exact date of his death.

1.1 Chronology

| | | |
|-----------------------------|---|---|
| 1109 | Birth at Cha (stag rtse rdzong) | van der Kuijp 1978 : 355 van der Kuijp 1983 : 59 < gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dGa' byed 32/5-33/1: <i>lo tsa ba chen pos lo bcu bdun phrag gsum du bzhugs nas lung rigs kyi bstan pa nyin mo ltar mdzad de mya ngan las 'das pa'i lo sa mo glang la cha [read: phya] pa chos kyi seng ge sku 'khrungs te</i> “The Great Translator, having lived for three times seventeen years, had acted like the day [illuminating] the teaching of the authoritative texts and reasoning; in the earth-female-ox year [1109, the year] of his nirvana, Phya-pa Chos-kyi seng-ge was born.” gSer mdog Paṅ chen – rNgog lo rol mo 4b4–5: <i>de rjes phya pa chos kyi seng ges gdan sa lo bcwa brgyad mdzad / 'di lo chen gshes pa'i lo / sa mo glang la 'khrungs nas...</i> gSer mdog Paṅ chen – dBu ma'i byung tshul 15b2–3: <i>chos kyi seng ge ni lo chen bde bar gshegs pa'i lo sku 'khrungs shing /</i> BDRC P1404 – Associated Places Sørensen&Hazard 2007 : 153, n. 402 (on the location of Cha/Phya, south-east of dGa' ldan) |
| ? | Monastic vows with Zhang tshes spong Chos kyi bla ma | See 1.2 “Zhang tshes spong” |
| ? | Final monastic ordination and vinaya studies with Bya 'dul | See 1.2 “Bya 'dul” |
| ca. 1129–? | Studies and assistantship under rGya dmar pa | See 1.2 “rGya dmar pa” and 1.5(i) |
| 1129 or later | Teaches Phag mo gru pa in sTod lung | See 1.3 “Phag mo gru pa” and 1.5(ii) |
| 1130 or later (before 1140) | Teaches Dus gsum mkhyen pa at Se thang in sTod lung | See 1.3 “Dus gsum mkhyen pa” and 1.5 (iii) |
| 1148 or 1152 | “Teacher” (ācārya) in the full ordination of Rin po che Glang lung pa | See 1.4 (ii) |
| ca. 1152–1169 | Abbot of gSang phu for 18 years (6 th abbot) | van der Kuijp 1978 : 356 < <i>'Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po</i> 292; Roerich 1949–1953 : I 329 “the abbot's chair was occupied by... Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge for 18 years.” An unlikely option is that he was abbot of gSang phu sNe'u thog for thirty-five years (i.e., 1134-1169), see Onoda 1989 : 205f. “According to an account which is quoted in the SPDR (= Byams pa - gSang phu gdan rabs), after 18 year he moved to Gro lung pa's place and studied under the master for 4 years. He then |

| | | |
|-----------|--|---|
| | | went back to gSang phu and occupied the abbatial seat for 17 years again." <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 15b3: <i>gdan sa lo bco brgyad mdzad pa'i bar la</i> |
| 1158–1169 | Teaches bSod nams rtse mo (and the other three <i>jo sras</i>) in gSang phu | See 1.3 and the ref. in <i>bSod nams rtse mo - bsTod pa</i> cited below, as well as the Four <i>jo sras</i> in 1.3. |
| 1169 | Death | <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : I 328: "Phya pa died in the year Earth Female Ox (sa mo glang 1169 A.D.)." <i>van der Kuijp 1978</i> : 355 <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4b4–5: <i>sa mo glang la 'khrungs nas / re gcig pa sa mo glang la gshegs /</i> <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - rNgog lo rol mo</i> 6a5: <i>sa mo glang gi lo la / slob dpon phyra pa 'das...</i> |
| | Death on the 23 rd of the third month | <i>van der Kuijp 1987</i> : 111, <i>Onoda 1989</i> : 206 < <i>bSod nams rtse mo - bsTod pa</i> 40/3/5: <i>sa mo glang gi lo'i nag pa zla ba nag po'i phyogs kyi tshes brgyad</i> |

1.2 Phya pa's teachers

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| rGya dmar pa Byang chub grags of sTod lung | Phya pa was his student and teaching-assistant for Madhyamaka and epistemology (before becoming a student of Gro lung pa). | <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : I 332: "The ācārya <i>phyra pa</i> also studied under him the systems of Mādhyamaka and Nyāya." <i>'Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po</i> 404: <i>slob dpon phywa pas dbu tshad gnyis ka'i rigs pa khong la bslabs pa yin</i> <i>van der Kuijp 1978</i> : 355 <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4b5: <i>'dis dang po khyung gi slob ma / rgya dmar ba byang chub grags la dbu tshad gsan / phyis gro lung pa la pha rol du phyin pa'i mdo dang / rgyan sogs gsung rab yongs su rdzogs par gsan /</i> <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 12b5–6: <i>de [=Gro lung pa] dang rgya dmar ba gnyis ka la phyra pa chos kyi seng ges gsan</i> |
| Bya 'dul (=? Bya 'dul ba 'dzin pa br'Tson 'grus 'bar, alias dge bshes Zul phu ba (c. 1100–1170)/(1091–1166)/(1100–1174)? ² ; two of his vinaya works are available in the <i>KDSB</i> , vol. 30 and 31) | Vinaya studies following final monastic ordination. | <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4b6: <i>bsnyen par rdzogs pa bya 'dul gyi drung du mdzad nas 'dul ba gsan /</i> |
| | Vinaya and Abhidharma studies following final monastic ordination. | <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 14b7: <i>'di'i drung du phyra pas bsnyen par rdzogs / 'dul sngon sogs gsan pa rgya che /</i> |
| | (Bya 'dul is also reported to have ordained and taught <i>vinaya</i> to Phag mo gru pa when the latter was 25, i.e. in 1134) | (cf. <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : 555) |
| | (Bya 'dul is also reported to have ordained Khyung tshang pa (1115–), who received the full ordination from rGya dmar pa) | (cf. <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : 441) |
| Gro lung pa Blo gros 'byung gnas | Phya pa studied with him the <i>Prajñāpāramitāsūtra(s)</i> with the <i>Ālaṃkāra</i> (= <i>Abhisamayālaṃkāra</i>) | <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4b5 <i>phyis gro lung pa la pha rol du phyin pa'i mdo dang / rgyan sogs gsung rab yongs su rdzogs par gsan</i> <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - rNgog lo rol mo</i> 5a6–7: <i>smad kyi slob ma'i chog ni phyra pa'o //</i> <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 12b5–6: <i>de [=Gro lung pa] dang rgya dmar ba gnyis ka la phyra pa chos kyi seng ges gsan</i> |
| | | <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : I 332: "When this Mahātman had reached the end of his |

² Śākya mchog ldan reports in *rNgog lo rol mo* (3b6) that Bya 'dul 'dzin was born the year rNgog Lo came back to Tibet, i.e., ca. 1092. In 6b5–6 (and in *dBu ma'i byung tshul* 14b5), he says that he was ordained by 'Bre shes rab 'bar and received from him the name in religion br'Tson 'grus 'bar.

| | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| | | life, the ācārya Phya pa studied with great diligence under him and composed an extensive commentary on the <i>Sphutārtha</i> .” |
| | (“at gSang phu sNe’u thog” ?) | van der Kuijp 1978: 356 < ? |
| Zhang Tshes spong ba Chos kyi bla ma | “Phya pa received the teaching of the <i>Ratnagotravibhāga</i> from Chos kyi bla ma.” | Kano 2010: 255, n. 21 < colophon of Phya pa’s <i>rGyud bla don gsak śa kya’i dge slong chos kyi bla ma’i zhabs kyi rdul phyi bos nod pa dge slong chos kyi sen ges nye bar sbyar ba rdzogs s.hyō / /</i> |
| | (“at gSang phu sNe’u thog” ?) | van der Kuijp 1978: 356 < (?) |
| | Phya pa took his monastic vows with him | gSer mdog Paṅ chen – <i>dBu ma’i byung tshul</i> 15b1–2: <i>sku’i gdan sa zhang tshen pong chos kyi bla ma la byung / de las nyang bran pa chos kyi ye shes dang / phya pa chos kyi seng ge rab tu byung /</i> . Cf. Sørensen&Hazod 2007: 164 n. 416. |

1.3 Phya pa’s students

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | | van der Kuijp 1978: 356 < ‘Gos lo tsā ba - <i>Deb ther sngon po</i> 297/4; Roerich 1949–1953: I 333; Kong sprul - <i>Shes bya ba kun khyab</i> I 454, dPa’ - <i>dGa’ ston</i> 340–341; gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>dBu ma’i byung tshul</i> 15b3 (pp. 238–239) gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4b7–5a4 |
| The “Eight Mighty Lions” (<i>seng chen brgyad</i>) (1) gTsang nag pa brTson ‘grus seng ge (2) Dan bag sMra ba’i seng ge / Dan ’bag sMra ba’i seng ge / Dan bag pa sMra ba’i seng ge / Dan ’bag pa sMra ba’i seng ge (3) Bru sha bSod nams seng ge (4) rMa bya rTsoḍ pa’i seng ge / rMa bya Byang chub brtson ‘grus (5) rTsags dBang phyug seng ge (6) Myang bran Chos kyi seng ge (7) lDan ma dKon mchog seng ge (/’Dam pa dKon mchog seng ge) (8) gNyal ma Yon tan seng ge; or rKyang dur ba gZhon nu seng ge; or ’U yug pa bSod nams seng ge | | gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>rNgog lo rol mo</i> 5a2–3 gives an alternative name for the Eighth Mighty Lion (probably a mistake on account of his name ending in “seng ge”): 1. (=5) brTsegs dbang phyug seng ge 2. (=1) gTsang nag pa brtson ‘grus seng ge 3. (=4) rMa bya rTsoḍ pa’i seng ge 4. (=3) Bru sha bsod nams seng ge 5. (=6) Myang bran pa Chos kyi seng ge 6. (=2) Dan ’bag pa sMra ba’i seng ge 7. (=7) ’Dam pa dKon mchog seng ge 8≠(8). rKyang dur ba gzhon nu seng ge la la dag ’u yug pa bsod nams seng ge zhes zer yang dus mi ’grig / gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>dBu ma’i byung tshul</i> speaks of Eight Great Lions and gives some details about the following ones (15b5–): - brtsegs (=5) - bru sha bsod nams seng ge (=3) - gtsang nag pa brtson ‘grus seng ge (=1) |
| The Four Jo sras (<i>jo sras mi bzhi</i>) (1) rNgog Jo sras Ra mo (=rgyal tsha ra mo, see below) (2) ’Khon Jo sras rTse mo (=bsod nams rtse mo, see below) (3) Khu Jo sras Ne tso (4) gNyos/sMyos Jo sras dPal le | | gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4b7–5a1: gnyis pa ni (= jo sras mi bzhi) i. (=2) sa jo sras bsod nams rtse mo / ii. (=4) mnyos jo sras dpal le / iii. (=3) khu jo sras ne tso / iv. (=1) rngog jo 5a1 sras ra mo rnams so // gSer mdog Paṅ chen – <i>dBu ma’i byung tshul</i> 15b3 : jo sras bzhi, but 16a1: jo sras gsum, among which - sa jo sras rtse mo (=i, =2) Ducher 2017: 290 “In [gSang phu] gNe’u thog, he was in a group of four sons of noble families [who studied] with Phya pa. There was bSod nams rtse mo of the ’Khon, rGyal tsha [Ra mo] of the rNgog, Ne rtso of the Khu, and dPal le of the sMyos.” < bSod nams dpal, <i>Bla ma rngog pa yab sras rim par byon pa’i rnam thar in po che’i rgyan gyi phreng ba</i> 21.3–4: <i>ne’u thog tu phya pa’i spyang sngar jo sras bzhi ’tshogs pa la: ’khon bsod mans rtse mo, rngog rgyal tsha, khu ne rtso, smyos dpal le dang bzhi’i nang nas...</i> |
| The Four/Three Wise Ones (<i>shes rab can mi gsum/bzhi</i>) (1) ’Gar dbang grub (2) Khong po ’jag chung (3) lHo pa sGog zan (4) Bar pu ba | | gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>rNgog lo rol mo</i> 5a1 lists only three “Wise ones”: gsum pa ni / (=shes rab can mi gsum) i. (=2) rkong po ’jag chung / ii. (=3) lho pa sgom gzan / iii. (= 4) par bu ba blo gros seng ge rnams so //(15b7: spar phu ba blo gros seng ge) sgom gzan ni (=ii) lho pa thams cad mkhyen par grags pa ste / lho pa dha ra seng ngo // |

| | |
|--|--|
| | gSer mdog Paṅ chen – <i>dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 15b3 also mentions only three “Wise ones” (shes rab can gsum), but speaks only about the first (=3): lho bran pa dar ma seng = lho pa thams cad mkhyen pa |
| The Three Who Attained Spiritual Goal-realization (<i>grub thob mi gsum</i>) (1) Dus gsum mkhyen pa dPal chos kyi grags pa (1110-1193), the first Karma-pa, who was in sTod lung at the age of 20 (i.e. 1130-). (2) Phag mo gru pa rDo rje rgyal po (1110–1170), who was in sTod lung at the age of 19 (i.e., 1129-) (3) gSal sto sho sgom (1116–1169) (?) zhang tshal pa / zhang 'tshal pa | gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>rNgog lo rol mo</i> 4a7: dang po ni (=grub thob mi gsum) i. (=1) rjes dus gsum mkhyen pa / ii. (=2) phag mo grub pa / iii. (=3) gsal sto sho sgom rnams so // la la zhang 'tshal pa yin zhes zer / gSer mdog Paṅ chen – <i>dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 16a2: <i>grub thob mi gsum du grags pa la / zhang tshal pa dngos slob yin min gyi bshad pa gnyis byung zhig /</i> 16a2-3: - (=i, =1) dbu ser grags pa'i rje dus gsum mkhyen pa = chos kyi bla ma = rdo rje 'od zer van der Kuijp 1983: 60 < Roerich 1949–1953: I 475: “At the age of 20, he [i.e., Dus gsum mkhyen pa (1110–1193)] visited sTod lungs sa thang. He heard from sTod lungs rGya dmar pa and his disciple the teacher and scholar Phya pa, who was learned in the Tibetan language only, the “Doctrine of Maitreya” (<i>byams chos</i>) and <i>the dbu ma sher gsum</i> .” <i>Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po</i> 565: <i>nyi shu pa la stod lungs se thang du phebs/ stod lungs rgyad mar pa dang / de'i slob ma bod skad rigs gcig pa la mkhas pa slob dpon phywa ba gnyis la byams chos dang dbu ma sher gsum gsan zhing mkhas par bslabs/</i> |
| rNgog rGyal tsha Ra mo (1134–1170) | Ducher 2017: 289 “He learned perfectly the teaching cycles on characteristics in gSang phu with master Phya pa.” < rNgog Byang chub dpal, <i>rje mar pa nas brgyud pa'i rngog bzhung pa yab sras kyi bla ma'i rnam thar nor bu'i phreng ba</i> 31.5–8; See also the 4 jo sras |
| bSod nams rtse mo (1142–1182), in gSang phu, where bSod nams brtse mo moved when he was sixteen (i.e., 1158) | van der Kuijp 1978: 357 < Thu'u bkwan - <i>Shel gyi me long</i> 200/3, Tucci 1949: 100–101 Onoda 1989: 205 < gSer mdog Paṅ chen - <i>rNgog lo rol mo</i> p. 453; Byams pa - <i>gSang phu gdan rabs</i> 9a See also the 4 jo sras |
| (?) 'Jad pa slob dpon sTon skyabs (b. 12 th c.) | BDRC P3779 < ? |

1.4 Monks ordained by Phya pa

| | Monk's name | Phya pa's role | |
|------|--|--|--|
| (i) | Se sPyil bu pa Chos kyi rgyal mtshan (1121–1189) (BDRC P3448) | Preceptor (<i>mkhan po</i> , Skt. <i>upādhyāya</i>) for his ordination and full ordination | Vetturini 2007: 133 and Vetturini 2007, Part 2: 260 < Lo dgon - 'Od stong: <i>rab byung dang bsnyen rdzogs gnyis ka'i mkhan po phya pas mdzad</i> <i>Ye shes rgyal mtshan - Se spyil bu ba'i rnam thar</i> 261,3–4: <i>dge bshes cha pa'i drung du rab tu byung / lo lon nas mkhan po de nyid las bsnyen par rdzogs</i> |
| (ii) | Rin po che Glang lung pa brTson 'grus gzhon nu (1123–1193) (a student of gTsang pa rin po che Nam mkha' rdo rje (1076–1160), born in sTod lung 'tshur, ordained by Pa tshab at 19 (i.e., 1141/1142)) | Member of the full ordination committee together with Bya 'dul 'dzin and bTsun pa Chos mchog gsum, when Rin po che was 29. (i.e., 1152), at sNon gyi gyad pa (read: gyang pa?) | Vetturini 2007, Part 2: 294 < Lo dgon - 'Od stong: <i>nyer bdun pa la snon gyi gyad par / bya 'dul 'dzin / phya pa chos seng / btsun pa chos mchog gsum la bsnyen par rdzogs</i> |
| | | Teacher (<i>slob dpon</i> , Skt. <i>ācārya</i>) for the full ordination together with Bya 'dul (preceptor) and sTon pa Chos mchog (secret preceptor) | Roerich 1949–1953: 298: “At the age of 25, he received the final monastic ordination at Gyang pa of Mar snon, Bya-'dul acting as upādhyāya, Phya-ba acting as ācārya and the scholar Chos-mchog as |

| | | | |
|-------|---|--|--|
| | | when Rin po che was 25. (i.e., 1148), at Mar snon gyi gyang ba | Secret Preceptor (gsang-ston). <i>'Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po</i> 362: <i>dgung lo nyi shu rtsa lnga pa la mar snon gyi gyang bar bya 'dul gyis mkhan po dang / phywa pas slob dpon dang / ston pa chos mchog gis gsang ste mdzad nas bsnyen par rdzogs/</i> |
| (iii) | Lho pa thams cad mkhyen pa=lho bran pa dar ma sen ge=lHo pa sgog/sgom zan | for lHo pa's ordination when the latter was 17. | <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 15b4: <i>shes rab can gcig ni lho bran pa dar ma seng ste / phywa pa'i drung du rang lo bcu bdun pa la rab tu byung /</i> |

1.5 Other information

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| (i) | Was rGya dmar pa's best student | <i>van der Kuijp 1978</i> : 355 < <i>Padma - Chos 'byung</i> 190b: <i>khyad par gangs pa she'u dang khyung gnyis ka'i dngos slob stod lungs rgya dmar pa byang chub grags / dbu tshad la de'i slob rna mang yang phvya pa chos kyi seng ge gtso bo /</i> ; "In particular, the direct disciple of both Gangs-pa she'u and Khyung (Rin-chen-grags-pa) was rGya-dmar-pa Byang-chub-grags of sTod-lung. Although he had many students in Madhyamaka and logic (<i>tshad-ma</i>), Phya-pa Chos-kyi seng-ge was the best." |
| (ii) | Held a grudge for eight years against Phag mo gru pa (1110–1170) as the latter was studying under rGya dmar pa (from 1129 onwards). | <i>van der Kuijp 1978</i> : 355 < <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : II 255 (= ' <i>Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po</i> 483/6-7). "[Phag mo gru pa] said that while he was studying under rGya-dmar-pa, he offended the kalyāṇamitra Phya-pa and for eight years was unable to expiate it." <i>Roerich 1949–1953</i> : II 255 "At the age of 19, he [=Phag mo gru pa] came to dbus. He unsaddled his horse (rta sga phog pa) at stod lung rgya dmar." |
| (iii) | Did not know Sanskrit (at least at the time of his early studies with rGya dmar ba) | See 1.3 under Dus gsum mkhyen. |
| (iv) | Had a debate with the Indian paṇḍit Jayānanda at gSang phu, in the presence of Khu Lo tsā ba mDo sde 'bar, and won the debate | <i>van der Kuijp 1983</i> : 69 < noted in passing in <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - Theg chen rgya mtsho</i> 2, 518; detailed account in the <i>gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul</i> 234: <i>phywa pa dbu ma rang rgyud la bshad nyan byed pa'i dus su / zla ba'i zhabs kyi brgyud 'dzin pandi ta jayānanda zhes pa zhing bod du byon / dbu ma la 'jug pa'i 'grel bshad mdzad / de'i dus su phywa pas dngos su brtsad cing / rgyud nas kyang zla ba'i bstan bcos kyi tshig don gnvis ka la dgag pa'i rnam grangs shin tu mang po yod pa'i bstan bcos mdzad / dgag pa ji ltar song yang phyogs snga ma ni nges par long pa zhig go //</i> <i>van der Kuijp 1993</i> : 193 |
| (v) | 'Gro lung pa was Phya pa's assistant (<i>zur chos pa</i>) when the latter was abbot of gSang phu | <i>van der Kuijp 1987</i> : 111 < <i>dPa' - Chos 'byung</i> 742–743 "In discussing the more wondrous aspects of 'Gro-lung-pa's life, Dpa' p. 742-743 mentions that when he was at gSang-phu ne'u-thog, probably in the capacity of assistant (zur-chos-pa) to his junior Phy[w]a-pa who at the time was abbot, there was a configuration of four teachers whose teaching quarters were in the immediate vicinity of Rngog Lo-tsa-ba's mausoleum. On the eastern side of the mausoleum, Phy [w] a-pa taught logic and epistemology; on the southern side Rgya Mching-ru-ba the Maitreya[nātha] texts; on the western side Rin-chen tshul-khrims the <i>abhidharma</i> ; and on the northern side of the mausoleum, Yon-tan shes-rab lectured on the <i>vinaya</i> ." |
| (vi) | Phya pa taught on the eastern side of rNgog Lo tsa ba's mausoleum | Post-colophon addition to rNgog Lo's biography by Gro lung pa in the manuscript published in KDSB 1, vol. 3, 285–333: <i>shar du phywa pas rnam nges 'chad //</i> „In the East, Phya pa exposes the (<i>Pramāṇa</i>) <i>viniścaya</i> ." and in the Bhutanese manuscript (see <i>Dram Dul</i> 2004: 76,3–4): <i>shar ru phywa pas rnam nges [bshad ?] //</i> |
| (vii) | Sectarian affiliation? | <i>van der Kuijp 1978</i> : 357 "Phya-pa was essentially non-sectarian although he is frequently met with in the bKa'-gdams-pa biographies. This is probably due to the fact that he is considered a perpetrator of the rNgog-lo-tsa-ba tradition and that he was the abbot of gSang-phu monastery." |
| (viii) | Wrote many refutations of Candrakīrti | <i>'Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po</i> 406: <i>slob dpon phywa bas slob dpon zla ba grags pa la dgag pa mang du mdzad pa la/</i> |

| | | |
|------|--|---|
| (ix) | His Prajñāpāramitā and Epistemological (?) lineage comes mainly from Gro lung pa | gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul 15b7: <i>phya pa'i phar tshad kyi bshad srol ni / gtso bor gro lung pa las byung ba ste /</i> |
|------|--|---|

2. Writings of Phya pa

See [Kano 2007](#): (47)–(48) n. 31 for a compilative list of the works of Phya pa (extant and attributed in [A khu – Tho yig](#)).

2.1 Extant works

(a) The first eighteen works in the table below, published in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* (Vols. 6–9), are listed in [Kano 2007](#): (21)–(23) and [Tauscher 2009–2010](#): 5–6. Editions/transcriptions that are publicly available, as well as translations (only of significant portions of the text) are indicated in the last two columns of the table below.

NB: The online resource <http://tibetan-studies.net> and KWIC-online search-tool still listed in the table has ceased to be accessible in 2022.

| | Short title | Colophon title | Catalogue title | <i>bKa' gdams gsung 'bum</i> | Editions/Transcriptions/Synoptic tables | Translations |
|---|------------------------------|---|---|--|---|--|
| 1 | <i>bDen gnyis rnam bshad</i> | <i>dBu ma bden pa gnyis rnam par bshad pa yi ge nyung ngus gzhung gsal bar byed pa</i> | <i>dBu ma bden gnyis kyi 'grel ba</i> | Vol. 6, 185–250 33 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • KWIC-online search-tool by Yoichi Fukuda showing the text in <i>dbu can</i> of paragraphs containing search words, which can be inputted in Tibetan script or in Wylie transcription. No. 18. Based on an e-text inputted by rNgag dbang 'od srung and proofread by Fumihito Nishizawa. http://tibetan-studies.net/tiblogsearch/index.cgi • Passages 6b4–6 and 18b7–8 ed. in Werner 2014: Appendix | English transl. in Werner 2014 (footnotes) |
| 2 | <i>bDen gnyis don bsdus</i> | <i>dBu ma bden pa gnyis kyi don bsdus pa</i> | | Vol. 6, 251–257 4 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • KWIC-online search-tool by Yoichi Fukuda showing the text in <i>dbu can</i> of paragraphs containing search words, which can be inputted in Tibetan script or in Wylie transcription. No. 19. Based on an e-text inputted by rNgag dbang 'od srung and proofread by Fumihito Nishizawa. http://tibetan-studies.net/tiblogsearch/index.cgi • Transcription and representation of the topical outline in table format by Hugon (with cross-references to (1) <i>bDen gnyis rnam bshad</i>) available online at https://www.oeaw.ac.at/en/ikga/forschung/tibetologie/materialien/phyapa • Synoptic table of the chapter <i>lung gi don gzhan du rtog pa la rigs pas bsgrub pa</i> (with cross-references to (1)) in Tauscher 2009–2010: 16 | |
| 3 | <i>sNang 'grel</i> | <i>dBu ma snang ba'i gzhung gi don rigs pa'i tshul dang myi 'gal zhing blo chung bas kyang bde blag du rtogs pa byis pa'i 'jug ngos su sbyar ba</i> | <i>dBu ma snang ba'i 'grel pa</i> | Vol. 6, 266–428 82 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • KWIC-online search-tool by Yoichi Fukuda showing the text in <i>dbu can</i> of paragraphs containing search words, which can be inputted in Tibetan script or in Wylie transcription. No. 21. Based on an e-text inputted by rNgag dbang 'od srung. http://tibetan-studies.net/tiblogsearch/index.cgi | |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Text in the process of being critically edited by Pascale Hugon and Jongbok Yi. https://www.oeaw.ac.at/en/ikga/research/tibetan-studies/research-areas/scholastic-traditions-in-tibetan-buddhism/early-tibetan-madhyamaka | |
| 4 | <i>rGyan 'grel</i> | <i>dBu ma brgyan gyi 'grel pa rgya cher bshad pa</i> | <i>dBu ma rgyan gyi 'grel ba</i> | Vol. 6, 433–518 43 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Passages 26a4–5 and 26b4–5 ed. in Werner 2014: Appendix | English transl. in Werner 2014 (footnotes) |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Sa bcad</i> of the excursus on the proof of emptiness in Hugon 2015b: 75–76 | |
| 5 | <i>sNyung po</i> | <i>dBu ma de kho na nyid kyi snying po</i> | <i>dBu ma'i de kho na nyid bsdus pa</i> | Vol. 7, 15–129 58 folios <i>dBu ma shar gsum gyi stong</i> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tauscher 1999 (ed.) – NB: ed. based on another manuscript than the one in the <i>bKa' gdams gsung bum</i> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • English transl. of the abbreviated topical outline in Tauscher 2003: 239–243 |

| | | | | | | |
|----|-----------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|
| | | | | <i>thun</i> on the title page = BDRC W23505 2078 (first folio missing) | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> English transl. of <i>sNyung po</i> 58,3–80,13 (based on the edition in Tauscher 1999) in Vose 2009: 141–169 |
| | | | | | | Japanese transl. of <i>sNyung po</i> 111,5–113,9 in Kosumi 2010: 22–24 |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 28,14–35,7 (on the four philosophical positions regarding conventionalities) ed. in Hugon forthcoming b | English transl. in Hugon forthcoming b |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passages 1,17–2,2; 24,10–22; 25,3–6; 28,14–18; 34,10–16; 61,4–8; 112,20–113,3 ed. in Werner 2014: Appendix | English transl. in Werner 2014 (footnotes) |
| 6 | <i>sPyod 'jug bsdus don</i> | <i>Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa'i don bsdus pa</i> | <i>sPyod 'jug bsdus don</i> | Vol. 7, 131–143 7 folios | | |
| 7 | <i>bSlab bsdus</i> | <i>bSlab pa kun las btus pa'i don bsdus pa</i> | | Vol. 7, 143–144 (fragment - 13 lines of the beginning of the text on the last folio of No. 6) | | |
| 8 | <i>rGyud bla bsdus don</i> | <i>Theg pa chen po rgyud bla ma'i bsdus pa'i don</i> | <i>Theg pa chen po rgyud bla ma'i bsdus don</i> | Vol. 7, 145–156 6 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The main subdivisions are transcribed in Kano 2008: 158–161 and compared with rNgog Lo's <i>bsdus don</i> on the same text. | |
| 9 | <i>rGyud bla don gsal</i> | <i>Theg pa chen po rgyud bla ma'i bstan bcos kyi tshig dang don gyi rgya cher bsnayad pa phra ba'i don gsal ba</i> | <i>Theg pa chen po rgyud bla ma'i bstan bcos rgya cher bsnayad pa phra ba'i don gsal ba</i> | Vol. 7, 163–345 92 folios | | |
| 10 | <i>mDo sde bshad</i> | <i>mDo sde rgyan gyi bshad pa</i> | <i>Theg chen mdo sde rgyan gyi legs bshad yang rgyan nyi 'od gsal ba</i> | Vol. 7, 351–537 94 folios | | |
| 11 | <i>mDo sde rnam bzhag</i> | <i>Theg pa chen po mdo sde rgyan gyi lus rnam bzhag</i> | <i>Theg chen mdo sde rgyan gyi lus rnam bzhag</i> | Vol. 7, 539–572 16 folios | | |
| 12 | <i>rNam nges bsdus don</i> | <i>Tshad ma rnam par nges pa'i bsdus don</i> | <i>Tshad ma rnam par nges pa'i bsdus don</i> | Vol. 8, 3–28 13 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Synoptic table by Hugon (with cross-references to (13) 'Od zer and the <i>Pramānaviniścaya</i>) available online at https://www.oeaw.ac.at/en/ikga/forschung/tibetologie/materialien/phyapa Manuscript description in Hugon 2009a | |
| 13 | <i>'Od zer</i> | <i>Tshad ma rnam par nges pa'i 'grel bshad yi ge dang rigs pa'i gnad la 'jug pa'i shes rab kyi 'od zer</i> | <i>Tshad ma rnam par nges pa'i 'grel ba</i> | Vol. 8, 35–427 197 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> KWIC-online search-tool by Yoichi Fukuda showing the text in <i>dbu can</i> of paragraphs containing search words, which can be inputted in Tibetan script or in Wylie transcription. No. 3. Based on a non-proofread e-text inputted by Pascale Hugon. http://tibetan-studies.net/tiblogsearch/index.cgi Edition of the excursus on proofs (143a1–b7) by Hugon, available at https://www.oeaw.ac.at/en/ikga/forschung/tibetologie/materialien/phyapa Edition of the excursus on <i>thal 'gyur</i> (145a2–149a5) by Hugon, available at https://www.oeaw.ac.at/en/ikga/forschung/tibetologie/materialien/phyapa | |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of the four philosophical positions (23b4–24a9) in Hugon 2016c | English transl. in Hugon 2016c |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passage on the invalidating argument in the proof of momentariness (126a4–130a1) edited in Hugon&Choi 2021 | English transl. in Hugon&Choi 2021 |
| 14 | <i>Mun sel</i> | <i>Tshad ma yid kyi mun pa sel ba</i> | <i>Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel</i> | Vol. 8, 434–626 97 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> KWIC-online search-tool by Yoichi Fukuda showing the text in <i>dbu can</i> of paragraphs containing search words, which can be inputted in Tibetan script or in Wylie transcription. No. 2. Based on a non-proofread e-text inputted by Dr. Thub bstan dga' ba. http://tibetan-studies.net/tiblogsearch/index.cgi | |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chap. 1 ed. in Nishizawa 2011b | |

| | | | | | | |
|----|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Critical edition of most of chap. 1 (1b1–34a4) (without some excursuses) and fragments from chap. 2 and 3 in Hugon&Stoltz 2019: 179–207 | English translation of these passages in Hugon&Stoltz 2019: 115–166 |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of the four philosophical positions (1b9–3b3) critically edited in Hugon 2016c | English transl. in Hugon 2016c |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passages 1b9–2a1, 2b1–6, 3a5–6, 3a7–9, 7a7–8 ed. in Werner 2014: Appendix. | English transl. in Werner 2014 (various footnotes) |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passages 3b2–9, 4a6–8, 6a6–8a5, 8a5–6 in Hugon 2008a: Annexe 1 (717–722). | |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passage on the definition of apprehended object (8a7–b2) edited in Hugon 2016c | English transl. in Hugon 2016c |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passage on the argumentative analogy between <i>yid dpyod</i> and <i>rtog pa</i> (10b6–9) edited in Stoltz 2009: 385 | English transl. in Stoltz 2009 : 383–384 |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Last part of chap. 2 ed. in Nishizawa 2011b: vol. 3 | Japanese transl. in Nishizawa 2011b : vol. 3 |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passages 43a7–b1, 45a4, 45a9–b4 in Hugon 2008a: Annexe 3. | |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Section on proof statements (81b3–83a1) edited in Hugon 2011a | |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Section on the eighteenfold typology of consequences (85b7–87a3) edited in Hugon (unpublished) | English transl. in Hugon (unpublished) |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chap. 5 ed. in Hugon forthcoming | English transl. in Hugon forthcoming |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Passage on the invalidating argument in the proof of momentariness (62b5–66b2) edited in Hugon&Choi 2021 | English transl. in Hugon&Choi 2021 |
| 15 | <i>Grub mtha'</i> | <i>bDe bar gshegs pa dang phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnam par 'byed pa</i> | <i>bDe bar gshegs pa dang phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnam par 'byed pa</i> | Vol. 9, 7–72 33 folios | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Yogācāra- and Mādhyamika-chapters crit. ed. in Werner 2014: 92–117 | English annotated translation of the Yogācāra- and Mādhyamika-chapters in Werner 2014 : 42–88. |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 29b3–30a6 ed. In Hugon 2016c | English translation in Hugon 2016c |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 30a6–31a2 ed. in Almogi 2010: 195–197 | English transl. in Almogi 2010 : 166–168 |
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Synoptic table (with Skt. equiv.) in Werner 2014: 23. Detailed outline of the Yogācāra chapter on p. 29, detailed outline of the Madhyamaka chapter on p. 36. | Japanese transl. of the synoptic table (with Tib. and Skt. equiv.) in Nishizawa 2013a : 69–71 |
| 16 | <i>So thar mdo 'grel ba</i> | <i>So thar mdo'i 'grel ba</i> | <i>So thar mdo'i 'grel ba</i> | Vol. 9, 87–243 79 folios | | |
| 17 | <i>'Od ldan rab gsal</i> | <i>'Od ldan zhes bya ba'i 'tikka tshig don rab tu gsal ba</i> | <i>'Od ldan zhes bya ba'i 'tikka tshig don rab gsal</i> | Vol. 9, 251–526 138 folios | | |
| 18 | <i>dGe tshul rnam bshad</i> | <i>Thams cad yod par smra ba'i dge tshul rnams ky'i bslab pa rim pa ston pa'i rnam par bshad pa</i> | <i>dGe tshul rnams ky'i bslab pa'i rim pa ston pa'i rnam bshad</i> | Vol. 9, 533–598 33 folios | | |
| 19 | <i>dGe tshul sum brgya rab 'byed</i> | <i>'Dul ba suM rgya pa'i Tik chen cha pa chos ky'i seng_nges mdzad pa</i> | <i>Dge tshul gyi tshig le'ur byas pa sum brgya pa'i tshig don rab tu ,byed pa</i> | Par gzhi dang po'i par thengs dang po, Ser gtsug nang bstan dpe rnying 'tshol bsdu phyogs bsgrigs khang, 2019. BDRC MW3CN22740 | | |

No. 1 in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* is a 33-folio text with the catalogue reference “Phyi tsha 120” on the cover page and the letter „Ga“ in the left margin on the recto of the folios. No. 2 in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* consists in 4 folios that are part of the same manuscript as No. 1. The two, together, correspond to *'Bras spungs catalogue* No. 015724, the title of which is given as *dbu ma bden pa gnyis ky'i don bsdu*, which corresponds to the title in the incipit of No. 2. (*dbu*

ma bden pa gnyis kyi don bsdus / phyA pa chos kyi seng ge / phyi tsa 120 / 'bru tsha / 37 folios / size 66.5x9.8)

Another entry, '*Bras spungs catalogue* No. 015710 – *slob dpon ye shes snying pos mdzad pa'i dbu ma bden pa gnyis rnam par 'byed pa* / PhyA pa chos kyi seng ge / phyi tsa 120 / 'bru tsha / 4 folios / 66.5x9.8cm) might be a duplicate entry of the last four folios of 'Bras spungs No. 015724 or another manuscript of text No. 2 (or an incomplete manuscript of No. 1).

No. 3 in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* is a 82-folio text with the catalogue reference "Phyi tsa 107" on the cover page. This corresponds to 'Bras spungs catalogue No. 015677 (*dbu ma'i yig cha phyA pas byas pa'o* / phyA pa chos seng / phyi tsa 107 / 'bru tsha / 82 folios / 66x11cm).

'Bras spungs catalogue lists another manuscript of No. 3 under catalogue No. 015726 (*dbu ma snang ba'i gzhung gi don rigs pa'i tshul ang mi 'gal zhing blo chung bas kyang bde blag tu rtogs pa byis pa'i 'jugs ngogs su sbyar ba bzhugs so* / phyA pa chos kyi seng ge / phyi tsa 120 / 'bru tsha / 87 folios / 66.5x9.8cm).

'Bras spungs catalogue lists as No. 015668 *dbu ma'i yig cha bzhugs so* / rigs pa smra ba'i dge slong chos kyi seng ge / 'bru tsha / Phyi tsa 107 / 82 folios / 66x10cm). Based on the number of folios, this could be yet another manuscript of No. 3.

No. 4 in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* is a 43-folio text with the with the catalogue reference "Phyi tsa 120" on the cover page and the letter "Kha" in the left margin on the recto of the folios. This corresponds to 'Bras spungs catalogue No. 015725 (*dbu ma rgyan gyi 'grel pa rgya cher bshad pa rigs par smra ba'i dge slong chos kyi seng ges sbyar ba bzhugs* / phyA pa chos kyi seng ge / 'bru tsha / 43 folios / 66.5x9.8).

No. 5 in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* is a 58-folio text (the first folio is missing). This is a different manuscript from the one edited in [Tauscher 1999 \(ed.\)](#) (45 folios (+4 lines) of 9 lines). See [Hugon 2012](#) for some remarks about the differences between these two versions of the text.

An edited version of texts No. 1, 3, 4, 5, 14 exists in a modern-format *dbu can* edition: *Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge. PhyA pa chos kyi seng ge'i gsung gces btus dbu tshad kyi yig cha*. Lhasa, 2012: Bod ljongs bod yig dpe rnying dpe skrun khang (Byang chub ljon bzang, no. 6).

Text No. 3 in this edition is not based on the manuscript published in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum*, but on a manuscript bearing the reference "phyi tsa 120", which must correspond to '*Bras spungs catalogue* No. 015726.

Text No. 4 is also included in a modern-format type-set edition of works related to the *Madhyamakālamkāra: dBu ma rgyan rtsa 'grel phyogs bsgrigs*. Bla rung sgar, [no date]: gSer ljongs bla ma rung lnga rig nang bstan slob grwa chen mo, 203–338 (BDRC W1KG8937).

This edition appears to be based on a manuscript of No. 4 different from the one in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum* ([Werner, personal communication](#)).

(b) The '*Bras spungs dkar chag* (p. 1822) lists an additional text attributed to Phya pa: *dPal lha mo nam mkha'i gos can gyi gtor chog*, which has not yet been published ([Kano 2007](#): (48) n. 31). No. 20873, phyi mA 44, dPal lha mon am mkha'i gos can gyi gtor chog slob dpon phyA pa yis mdzad pa dang / bskang gso man ngag dang bcas pa bzhugs so; phyA pa chos seng; dpe tshugs; 11f. 50x9 cm.

(c) The *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum dkar chag* (vol. 1, p. 62) reports that damaged remains of a large commentary on Śāntideva's *Śikṣāsamuccaya* (*bSlab btus kyi 'grel chen*) by Phya pa were discovered in 'Bras spungs and that this text, along with No. 6 and No. 8, is also recorded in the dKar chag of sNye mo bye mkhar chos sde monastery ([Werner 2014](#): 20).

2.1.a Chronology of the works

Phya pa refers to *sNying po* (No. 5) in *sNang 'grel* (No. 3). (*sNang 'grel* 47a6: *'di rnams kyi don gyi cha ni kho bos de kho na nyid kyi snying por rgya cher gtan la dbab pas 'dir ma spros te // legs par rtogs par 'dod pas de las blta bar bya'o //* Passage identified by Jongbok Yi, cited in [Hugon 2015b](#): 81, n. 9)

In *rGyan 'grel* he refers to two other works in which he deals extensively with the proof of emptiness. One of them might be *sNying po* (See 2.2.1).

There are virtually identical passages in the *Mun sel* (No. 14) and the *'Od zer* (No. 13) – for example *Mun sel* 68a9–72a5 = *'Od zer* 111b5–115b1 – but I am unable at this point to ascertain the order of their composition.

There are closely parallel passages in the *Mun sel/'Od zer* and the *sNying po* (No. 5), some of which with a significant adaptation of the terminology to the epistemological, respectively the Madhyamaka context of the discussion. Similarly, I am unable to ascertain an order of composition at this point.

2.2 Works attributed to Phya pa

2.2.1 By himself

In his *rGyan 'grel* Phya pa refers to two of his works with the expressions *Shes rab gsum la 'jug pa* (“Introduction to the three kinds of wisdom”) and *'Jug ngogs bsdu bar bstan* (em. *gtan?*) *la phab pa* (“Summarized introduction”?) (*rGyan 'grel* 9a7: *tshul lugs 'di dag rgya cher kho bos shes rab gsum la 'jug pa dang 'jug ngogs bsdu bar bstan* (em. *gtan?*) *la phab pa der blta bar bya ste / 'dir rkang pa rkyang ste gnas pa'i yi ge cha tsam mthong pas ngo bo nyid myed par khas che ba rnams kyi spyir cha tsam brjod pa yin no //*. Cited in [Hugon 2015b](#): 82, n. 22)

One of the works referred to in this passage might be the *sNying po*, where a corresponding excursus is found.

The expression “*'jug ngogs*” recalls the description of *sNang 'grel* in its colophon (*dbu ma snang ba'i gzhang gi don rigs pa'i tshul dang myi 'gal zhing blo chung bas kyang bde blag du rtogs pa byis pa'i 'jug ngogs su sbyar ba rigs par smra ba'i dge slong chos kyi seng ges sbyar ba//*)³, but the *sNang 'grel* does not include a corresponding excursus.

2.2.2 By Bu ston rin chen grub (1290–1364)

Van der Kuijp reports that Bu ston was familiar with a *Chos 'byung* by Phya pa ([van der Kuijp 2016](#): 248 and n. 117, and 280 for the Tibetan text and translation of the relevant passage).

2.2.3 By 'Gos lo tsā ba gzhon nu dpal (1392–1481)

1478: *'Gos lo tsā ba - Deb ther sngon po*

- Commentary(/ies) on the “Five Treatises” of Maitreya
- Commentary on the *Pramāṇaviniścaya*
- Commentary on the *Satyadvayavibhaṅga*
- Commentary on the *Mādhyamakālamkārikā*
- Commentary on the *Madhyamakāloka*
- Commentary on the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*
- Commentaries on other texts

³ A similar expression is used in the final verses of the *rGyan 'grel* (43a7): *dbu ma brgyan gyi rtogs sla byis pa'i 'jug ngogs su // rnam par phye te skyon myed bdag gis sbyar pa yin //*

- Abridgments of the preceding texts
- *Tshad ma'i bsdus pa yid kyi mun sel* in verse only and with an auto-commentary
- Large and short abridgments of the Madhyamaka system
- "Summary on the theories of non buddhists and Buddhists" *Phya nang gi grub mtha' bsdus pa* (reportedly)
- "Exposition of the five bases of the knowable" *shes bya gzhi lnga'i bshad pa* (reportedly)

([405 in the Chengdu ed.] *slob dpon phywa bas ni ne'u thog gi gdan sa ma mdzad gong nas chos grwa mang du bskyangs shing / bstan bcos brtsams pa yang byams pa'i chos lnga dang / tshad ma rnam par nges pa dang / dbu ma bden gnyis/ rgyan/ snang ga spyod 'jug la sogs pa'i TI ka mang po yang mdzad/ so so'i bsdus pa yang mang du brtsams/ tshad ma'i bsdus pa yid kyi mun sel zhes bya ba tshigs su bcad pa rang 'grel dang bcas pa dang / yid kyi mun sel rkyang pa ste gnyis mdzad/ dbu ma la yang bsdus pa che chung gnyis snang / gzhan yang rtsom pa mang po mdzad pa 'dra ste kho bos mthong ba ni de dag dang / phyi nang gi grub mtha' bsdus pa dang shes bya gzhi lnga'i bshad pa tsam zhid go khong la...*)

Roerich 1949–1953: 332–333: "The Teacher *phywa pa* before occupying the chair of *ne'u thog* (gsang phu) maintained many religious schools, composed śāstras, numerous commentaries on the "Five Treatises" of Maitreya, the *Pramāṇaviniścaya*, the *dbu ma bden gnyis*, the *Madhyamakālamkārikā*, the *Madhyamakāloka*, the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* and other texts. He also composed their respective abridgements. He composed the *tshad ma'i bsdus pa yid kyi mun sel* in verses and an auto commentary thereon; also a *yid kyi mun sel* without a commentary. Also a large and short abridgment of the Madhyamaka system. Further, he seems to have composed many other compositions.

These had been seen by me and I also have heard about a *phyi nang gi grub mtha' bsdus pa*, or "Summary on the theories of non buddhists and Buddhists", and about a *shes bya gzhi lnga'i bshad pa*, "Exposition of the five bases of the knowable" by him.")

- An extensive commentary on the *Sphuṭārtha* (when studying with Gro lung pa) (Cf. 1.2, Gro lung pa)

2.2.4 By gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan (1428–1507)

1501*: gSer mdog Paṅ chen - *dGa' byed* (*Jackson 1987: 167)

gSer mdog paṅ chen - *dGa' byed* 12-13

- Commentary to Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇavārttika* (doubtful)
- Commentary to Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇaviniścaya*
- Epistemological summaries: extensive, intermediate, short

(*slob dpon phywa pas rnam 'grel nges gnyis ka'i ti ka dang / tshad bsdus rgyas 'bring bsdus pa sogs rtog ge'i rnam bshad mang du mdzad pa > van der Kuijp 1978: 357*)

gSer mdog paṅ chen - *dGa' byed* 32

- Epistemological summaries: extensive, intermediate, short; the intermediate one is the *Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel*

(*tshad ma rnam par nges pa rtsa 'grel la bshad pa'i gzhi dang gtso bo mdzad mod kyang rang nyid kyi rnam dpyod kyi rtsal gyis bton nas bsdus pa rgyas 'bring bsdus gsum mdzad par grags pa de'i nang nas 'bring po tshad ma yid kyi mun sel gyi bshad pas ni dus der gangs can gyi rtog ge pa mtha' dag la khyab cing gces spras su byed pa ... > van der Kuijp 1978: 357.*)

Transl. in van der Kuijp 1983: 59: "...he indeed took the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* and its commentary as the basis and main [texts] for [his] explanations, it is well known that by deploying the capacity (*rtsal-gyis bton-nas*) of his own intellect, he composed the three Summaries [of] large, medium, and synoptic [length]. From among these [three], the explanations of the [one of] medium [length], the *Tshad-ma yid kyi mun-sel*, pervaded at this time [the hearts of] all the Tibetan logicians and was cherished (*gces spras-su byed-pa*) [by them].")

2.2.5 By A khu Rin po che Shes rab rgya mtsho (1803–1875)

A khu - *Tho yig* 637–677

Lam rim section

- Commentary on the *Bodhicaryāvatāra* (No. 11076)

dBu ma section

- Commentary on the *Satyadvayavibhaṅga* (No. 11317)

- Commentary on the *Madhyamakāloka* (No. 11318)
- Commentary on the *Madhyamakālaṅkāra* (No. 11319)
- Commentary on the *Uttaratantra* (No. 11320)
- Long and short summaries of Madhyamaka (No. 11321)

Phar phyin section

- Commentary on the *Prajñāpāramitā* (No. 11473) (according to [Tauscher](#) (1999 ed.: viii), this may be the commentary on the *Sphuṭārtha* mentioned in ‘[Gos lo tsā ba – Deb ther sngon po](#))

rNam ‘grel section

- Commentary on the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* (No. 11803)
- *Tshad ma’i bsdus pa yid kyi mun sel* with an auto-commentary (No. 11804)
- *Tshad bsdus Yid kyi mun sel* (without auto-commentary) (No. 11805)
- *Shes bya gzhi lnga’i bshad pa* (No. 11806)

Grub mtha’ section

- *Phyi nang gi grub mtha’i rnam bzhag bsdus pa* (No. 11910)

The complete list is given in [Tauscher 1999 \(ed.\): VIII](#). [Van der Kuijp 1983](#): 63 lists the entries from the *rNam ‘grel* section.

3. Modern studies dealing with Phya pa, his life, his works, his ideas

Note: Publications that predate the rediscovery of Phya pa’s text deal with his views on the basis of later accounts, notably by Śākya mchog ldan or Go rams pa, and of Tibetan views criticized by Sa skya Paṇḍita (the attribution of some of which to Phya pa is problematic).

3.1 In English

| | | |
|--------|-------|---|
| Almogi | 2010 | On the distinction between Māyopamādvayavāda versus Sarvadharmāpratiṣṭānavāda in Phya pa’s doxography |
| Huang | 2014 | Discusses in the introduction Phya pa’s role on the development of argumentation and debate and the origin of the <i>chos-te-phyir</i> pattern (see in particular pp. 20-35). |
| Hugon | 2004 | On Phya pa’s understanding of the three characteristics of a correct logical reason in inference |
| Hugon | 2008b | On Phya pa’s style of argumentation |
| Hugon | 2009a | On Phya pa’s <i>rNam nges bsdus don</i> |
| Hugon | 2009b | On Phya pa’s theory of definition |
| Hugon | 2011a | On Phya pa’s theory of argumentation and his prescriptions regarding proof statements |
| Hugon | 2011b | On Phya pa’s views on perception, including a discussion of his definition of valid cognition |
| Hugon | 2011c | Includes a discussion of Phya pa’s interpretation of Dharmakīrti’s definition of valid cognition and the scope of valid cognition |
| Hugon | 2013 | Overview of Phya pa’s theory of arguments by consequence (<i>thal ‘gyur</i>) and prescriptions regarding consequence statements |
| Hugon | 2015a | Entry in the SEP dealing with early Tibetan views on epistemology and philosophy of language, among which those of Phya pa |
| Hugon | 2015b | On the proof of emptiness, its epistemological background, the nature of the probandum |

| | | |
|--------------|-----------------|---|
| Hugon | 2016a | On the eighteenfold classification of arguments by consequence (<i>thal 'gyur</i>) based on the nature of the logical reason |
| Hugon | 2016b | Sequel to Hugon 2013, goes into the details of Phya pa's basic classification of consequences |
| Hugon | 20016c | Characterization of Phya pa's philosophical position, discussion of his refutation of idealism and Sautrāntika representational external realism |
| Hugon&Stoltz | 2019 | Detailed discussion of Phya pa's philosophy of mind, including his views on the criteria for being a valid cognition, and his typology of invalid cognitions. Includes edition and English translation of the relevant portion of Chap. 1 of the <i>Mun sel</i> . |
| Hugon | 2020 (in press) | Phya pa's solution to the problem of unestablished subjects in arguments by consequence (<i>thal 'gyur</i>) |
| Hugon&Choi | 2021 | Phya pa on the invalidating argument in the proof of momentariness |
| Kano | 2008 | Lists the main subdivisions of Phya pa's Topical Outline of the <i>Ratnagoṭravibhāga</i> , compared with that of rNgog Lo |
| Kano | 2010 | Discusses Phya pa's interpretation of the <i>Ratnagoṭravibhāga</i> in comparison with rNgog Lo's interpretation |
| Kano | 2016 | Discusses in chapter 10 rNgog Lo's impact on doctrinal developments related to the <i>Ratnagoṭravibhāga</i> from the 11 th to early 14 th c., including Phya pa's view, which are dealt with in more detail on pp. 296–309. |
| Kellner | 1997 | Phya pa on conceptual incompatibility and logical reasons qua non-apprehension (based on Śākya mchog ldan's account) |
| Moriyama | 2010 | Discusses Phya pa's definition of the two truths and their relation |
| Nemoto | 2013 | Discusses Phya pa's definition of a proper opponent and the various types of opponents |
| Nishizawa | 2013b | English version of Nishizawa 2012b (in Japanese), see pp. 350–352 on Phya pa's place in the gSang phu tradition. |
| Nishizawa | 2016b | English version of material presented in Nishizawa 2013c, 2015 and 2016a (in Japanese), see pp. 154–159 on Phya pa's theory of perception |
| Onoda | 1986 | Phya pa's classification of arguments by consequence according to their nature, and based on the type of the logical reason (based on Śākya mchog ldan's account and speculations from Sa skya Paṇḍita's presentation of the opponent's view) |
| Onoda | 1989 | Chronology of abbots in gSang phu |
| Onoda | 1992 | Phya pa on the types of incompatibility and their definition (based on Śākya mchog ldan and other later accounts) |
| Stoltz | 2007 | On <i>yid dpyod</i> in the early bKa' gdams tradition and Phya pa |
| Stoltz | 2009 | On <i>yid dpyod</i> |
| Stoltz | 2014 | On types of objects and of cognitions, and on the criteria for knowledge |
| Stoltz | 2021 | A rang of epistemological topics |
| Tauscher | 1999 | A preliminary discussion of Phya pa's views on <i>prasaṅga</i> , before his epistemological works became available, based on <i>sNying po</i> only |

| | | |
|---------------|-----------------------|--|
| Tauscher | 2003 | Discusses Phya pa's Madhyamaka position |
| Tauscher | 2009–2010 | Sums up biographical information on Phya pa, repeats some points discussed in Tauscher 2003, and discusses the style of Phya pa's <i>bsdus don</i> works |
| van der Kuijp | 1978 | Pioneering article on Phya pa, providing information about his life and works, and discussing his views on the typology of mind (based on Go rams pa's account) |
| van der Kuijp | 1983 | Chap. 2 on Phya pa, life and works, and on his views (based on later accounts by Śākya mchog ldan and Go rams pa) |
| van der Kuijp | 1987 | Chronology of the abbatial succession of gSang phu monastery |
| van der Kuijp | 2003 | Preliminary remarks on Phya pa's recovered epistemological works |
| Vose | 2009 | On Phya pa's views regarding the ultimate and his criticism of Candrakīrti-oriented Madhyamaka. Reviewed in Hugon 2012. |
| Vose | 2015 | On Phya pa's proof of emptiness and the combination of inference and <i>rig shes</i> . |
| Wangchuk | 2017 | Discusses in the first chapter Phya pa (and rNgog Lo)'s interpretation of the <i>Uttaratantra</i> |
| Werner | 2014 (unpublished) | Phya pa's presentation and criticism of Yogācāra and his discussion of Madhyamaka in his doxography (with a general presentation of the text and an edition and translation of the two relevant chapters). |

3.2 In French

| | | |
|-------|-------|---|
| Hugon | 2008a | Several chapters deal with Phya pa's views on ontology, epistemology and logic. |
|-------|-------|---|

3.3 In Japanese

| | | |
|-----------|------------------------|---|
| Akahane | 2010 | Presents Phya pa's <i>bDen gnyis rnam bshad</i> |
| Fukuda | 1989 | On Phya pa's views on the object of cognition (based on the presentation of the opponent's view in Sa skya Paṇḍita's <i>Rigs gter</i>) |
| Kano | 2002 | Phya pa's interpretation of the <i>Ratnagoṭravibhāga</i> l. 26. |
| Kosumi | 2010 | Translation and comments on a passage of the <i>sNying po</i> pertaining to the topic of moments (<i>kṣaṇa</i>) |
| Moriyama | 2001 | Discusses Phya pa's definition of the two truths and their relation |
| Nemoto | 2008 | Deals with Phya pa's views on momentariness |
| Nemoto | 2011 | The third chapter deals with Phya pa's interpretation of the Madhyamaka view of time (revised version of Nemoto 2008). Brief English summary on p. 360. |
| Nishizawa | 2010 | Phya pa's definition of <i>tshad ma</i> |
| Nishizawa | 2011a | Phya pa's criticism of rNgog Lo on the ascertainment of validity |
| Nishizawa | 2011b (unpublished) | Doctoral dissertation on Tibetan Buddhist logic, with numerous references to Phya pa. |
| Nishizawa | 2012a | On Phya pa's philosophical standpoint |
| Nishizawa | 2012b | Deals with Phya pa's place in the gSang phu tradition |
| Nishizawa | 2012c | Deals with Phya pa's theory of <i>rtogs pa</i> on pp. 97–99 and 101–103 |
| Nishizawa | 2013a | On Phya pa's <i>Grub mtha'</i> |

| | | |
|-----------|-------|--|
| Nishizawa | 2014 | Deals with Phya pa's views on exclusion (<i>apoha</i>) on pp. 250–274. |
| Nishizawa | 2016c | Deals with Phya pa's theory of perception |
| Nishizawa | 2018 | Madhyamaka thought of Phya pa |
| Nishizawa | 2018 | Phya pa, rGya dmar ba, Gro lung pa, rNgog lo tsā ba on emptiness |
| Nishizawa | 2019 | Gro lung pa and rGya dmar ba (and Phya pa?) on the two truths |

Bibliographical references

The metadata for all the entries listed below can now be found in the Zotero group library “Phya pa”:
https://www.zotero.org/groups/4973554/phy_a_pa

1. Collections of texts, catalogues, etc.

KDSB = bKa' gdams gsung 'bum

bKa' gdams gsung 'bum phyogs bsgrigs thengs dang po/gnyis pa/gsum pa/bzhi pa. Ed. dPal brtsegs bod yig dpe rnying zhib 'jug khang. Vols. 1–30, Chengdu, 2006; vols. 31–60, Chengdu, 2007; vols. 61–90; Chengdu, 2009; vols. 91–120, Chengdu 2015: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang.

bKa' gdams gsung 'bum dkar chag

bKa' gdams gsung 'bum dkar chag. 4 vols. Chengdu: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2006–2016.

'Bras spungs dkar chag

'Bras spungs dgon du bzhugs su gsol ba'i dpe rnying dkar chag. dPal brtsegs bod yig dpe rnying zhib 'jug khang. 2 Vols. Mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2004.

BDRC

Buddhist Digital Resource Center (formerly Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center).
<https://library.bdrc.io/>.

2. Individual authors (ancient and modern)

Listed alphabetically, following the order of the Latin alphabet. For Tibetan authors, the root letter of the first syllable is taken as the initial letter.

Akahane 2010

Ritsu Akahane, “Three Tibetan Commentaries on *dBu ma bden gnyis*” (in Japanese), *Report of the Japanese Association for Tibetan Studies* 56, 77–85.

Almogi 2010

Orna Almogi, “Māyopamādvayavāda versus Sarvadharmāpratiṣṭānavāda: A Late Indian Subclassification of Madhyamaka and its Reception in Tibet,” *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 14, 135–212.

A khu - Tho yig

A khu Ring po che Shes rab rgya mtsho (1803–1875), *dPe rgyun dkon pa 'ga' zhib gi tho yig. Don gnyer yid kyi kunda bzhad pa'i zla 'od 'bum gyi snye ma*. Lokesh Chandra, 1963, 637–830.

Byams pa - gSang phu gdan rabs

Byams pa kun dga' 'byung gnas, *dPal ldan gsang phu'i gdan rabs bsal ba'i me long*, Ōtani no. 13981.

Dram Dul 2004

Dram Dul, *Jig rten mig gcig blo ldan shes rab kyi rnam thar. Biography of Blo ldan shes rab. The Unique Eye of the World by Gro luñ pa Blo gros 'byuñ gnas. The Xylograph Compared with a Bhutanese Manuscript*. Vienna: ATBS (WSTB 61).

Ducher 2017

Cécile Ducher, *A Lineage in Time: The Vicissitudes of the rNgog pa bka' brgyud from the 11th through 19th c.* Thèse de Doctorat de l'Université de recherche Paris Sciences et Lettres, préparée à l'Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes (unpublished).

Fukuda 1989

Yoichi Fukuda, “チャパ・チューキセンゲとサキヤ・パンディタの対象設定の理論,” [“On the Theory of the Object of Cognition of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge and Sa skya Paṇḍita”], *Tōhōgaku* 78 (『東方学』), [140]–[127].

'Gos lo tsā ba - *Deb ther sngon po*

'Gos lo tsā ba gZhon nu dpal (1392–1481), *Deb ther(gter) sngon po*. Ed. L. Chandra, New Delhi, 1974. Chengdu, 1984: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang.

Huang 2014

Chun Yuan Huang, *A Record of a Tibetan Medieval Debate: History, Language, and Efficacy of Tibetan Buddhist Debate*. Ph.D. thesis, Harvard University. (<https://dash.harvard.edu/handle/1/12269848?show=full>)

Hugon 2004

Pascale Hugon, “Interpretations of the *Trairūpya* in Tibet,” *Hōrin* 11, 95–117.

Hugon 2008a

Pascale Hugon, *Trésors du raisonnement. Sa skya Paṇḍita et ses prédécesseurs tibétains sur les modes de fonctionnement de la pensée et le fondement de l'inférence. Edition et traduction annotée du quatrième chapitre et d'une section du dixième chapitre du Tshad ma rigs pa'i gter*. Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien – Universität Wien (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 69.1 and 69.2).

Hugon 2008b

Pascale Hugon, “Arguments by Parallels in the Epistemological Works of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge,” *Argumentation* 22.1, 93–114. (DOI 10.1007/s10503-007-9074-7)

Hugon 2009a

Pascale Hugon, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's Synoptic Table of the *Pramāṇaviniścaya*,” in *Sanskrit Manuscripts in China. Proceedings of a panel at the 2008 Beijing Seminar on Tibetan Studies, October 13 to 17*, E. Steinkellner, D. Qing, H. Krasser (eds.), Beijing: China Tibetology Publishing House, 47–88.

Hugon 2009b

Pascale Hugon, “The Origin of the Theory of Definition and its Place in Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's Epistemological System,” in *Tibetan Scholasticism in the 11th and 12th Centuries – Contributions to a panel at the XVth Congress of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Atlanta, 23-28 June 2008. Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 32 (2009) [2010], P. Hugon and K. Vose (ed.), 319–368.

Hugon 2011a

Pascale Hugon, “Argumentation Theory in the Early Tibetan Epistemological Tradition,” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 34.1–2, 97–148.

Hugon 2011b

Pascale Hugon, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's Views on Perception,” in *Religion and Logic in Buddhist Philosophical Analysis. Proceedings of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti*

Conference. Vienna, August 23–27, 2005. H. Krasser, H. Lasic, E. Franco, B. Kellner (ed.), Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 159–176

Hugon 2011c

Pascale Hugon, “Is Dharmakīrti Grabbing the Rabbit by the Horns? A Reassessment of the Scope of *prameya* in Dharmakīrtian Epistemology,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 39.4–5 (special issue: *Proceedings of the Philosophy Panel at the XIVth World Sanskrit Conference [Kyoto, Japan, September 1–5, 2009]*), 367–389. (DOI 10.1007/s10781-011-9137-9)

Hugon 2012

Pascale Hugon, Review of: Kevin A. Vose, *Resurrecting Candrakīrti: Disputes in the Tibetan Creation of Prāsaṅgika*, Boston, 2009: Wisdom Publications. *Indo-Iranian Journal* 55, 175–188. (DOI 10.1163/001972412X620277)

Hugon 2013

Pascale Hugon, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge on Argumentation by Consequence (*thal ’gyur*): The Nature, Function, and Form of Consequence Statements,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 41.6, 671–702 (DOI 10.1007/s10781-013-9205-4).

Hugon 2015a

Pascale Hugon, “Tibetan Epistemology and Philosophy of Language,” The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Spring 2015 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2015/entries/epistemology-language-tibetan/>>. [Revised entry. Original entry 2011]

Hugon 2015b

Pascale Hugon, “Proving Emptiness – The Epistemological Background for the ‘Neither One nor Many’ Argument and the Nature of its Probandum in Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge’s Works,” *Journal of Buddhist Philosophy* 1, 58–94.

Hugon 2016a

Pascale Hugon, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge and His Successors on the Classification of Arguments by Consequence (*thal ’gyur*) Based on the Type of the Logical Reason,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 44.5, 883–938 (DOI: 10.1007/s10781-015-9285-4).

Hugon 2016b

Pascale Hugon, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge on Argumentation by Consequence (*thal ’gyur*) (2): The analysis of the correspondence between a consequence and its reverse form and the thirteenfold typology of consequences.” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 39, 51–113.

Hugon 2016c

Pascale Hugon, “Can one be a Mādhyamika, a crypto-Vaibhāṣika, and a faithful interpreter of Dharmakīrti? On Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge’s doxographical divisions and his own philosophical standpoint,” *Journal of Tibetology/Zangxue xuekan* 15, 51–153.

Hugon 2020

Pascale Hugon, “Universals, Demons’ Pots, and Demons’ Permanent Pots: Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge on unestablished subjects in arguments by consequence,” in *Reverberations of Dharmakīrti’s Philosophy: Proceedings of the Fifth International Dharmakīrti Conference Heidelberg, August 26–30, 2014*, B. Kellner, P. McAllister, H. Lasic, and S. McClintock (eds.), Vienna: Austrian Academy of Sciences Press.

Hugon (unpublished)

Pascale Hugon, "Translations that make sense."

Hugon forthcoming

Pascale Hugon, *Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge, Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel, Fifth chapter. Edition and translation.*

Hugon&Stoltz 2019

Pascale Hugon and Jonathan Stoltz, *The Roar of a Tibetan Lion – Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's theory of mind in philosophical and historical perspective*, Vienna: Austrian Academy of Sciences Press. v+410 pages. (OA: <https://verlag.oeaw.ac.at/the-roar-of-a-tibetan-lion>)

Hugon&Choi 2020

Pascale Hugon and Kyeongjin Choi, "Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge on the invalidating argument in the proof of momentariness," *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 44, 209–244. (DOI 10.2143/JIABS.44.0.3290293).

Jackson 1987

David Jackson, *The Entrance Gate for the Wise (Section III). Sa-skya Paṇḍita on Indian and Tibetan Traditions of Pramāṇa and Philosophical Debate*, Vienna: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien – Universität Wien (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 17.1 and 17.2).

Kano 2002

Kazuo Kano, "Phywa pa Chos kyi seng ge's Interpretation on *Ratnagoṭravibhāga* I.26," *Indogaku Bukkyogaku Kenkyū* 51–2, 109–111. [In Japanese]

Kano 2007

Kazuo Kano, "rNgog Blo ldan shes rab cho Shokan kanro no shizuku: Kōtei text to naiyō gaikan [rNgog Blo ldan shes rab's *Springs yig bdud rtsi'i thig le*: Critical edition and survey]," *Kōyasan daigaku mikkyōbunka kenkyūjo kiyō* 20, (1)–(58).

Kano 2008

Kazuo Kano, "rNgog blo ldan shes rab's Topical Outline of the *Ratnagoṭravibhāga* discovered at Khara Khoto," in *Contributions to Tibetan Literature*, Orna Almogi (ed.). Halle: IITBS.

Kano 2010

Kazuo Kano, "rNgog Blo ldan shes rab's position on the Buddha-nature doctrine and its influence on the early gSañ phu tradition," *Tibetan Scholasticism in the 11th and 12th Centuries – Contributions to a panel at the XVth Congress of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Atlanta, 23-28 June 2008. Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 32 (2009) [2010], P. Hugon and K. Vose (ed.), 249–283.

Kano 2016

Kazuo Kano, *Buddha-Nature and Emptiness – rNgog Blo-lدان-shes-rab and The Transmission of the Ratnagoṭravibhāga from India to Tibet*. Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien – Universität Wien (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 91).

Kellner 1997

Birgit Kellner, "Types of incompatibility (*'gal ba*) and types of non-cognition (*ma/mi dmigs*) in early Tibetan *tshad ma* literature," in *Tibetan Studies: Proceedings of the 7th Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, Graz 1995*. Helmut Krasser, Michael Torsten Much,

Ernst Steinkellner, Helmut Tauscher (ed.). Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 495–510.

Kosumi 2010

Takechika Kosumi (古角武睦), “Indo-Chibetto ni okeru yugagyō-chūgan-ha no setsuna-ron ni tsuite no denshō” [インド・チベットにおける瑜伽行中觀派の刹那論についての伝承.] {A Tradition of Yogācāra-Mādhyamika's Views on Kṣaṇa in India and Tibet.}, *Bukkyōdaigaku Daigakuin Kiyō* (Bungaku Kenkyūka Hen) [佛教大学大学院紀要(文学研究科篇)] {The Bukkyo University Graduate School Review (compiled by the Graduate School of Literature)} 38 (March 2010), 13-30.

Kong sprul - *Shes bya ba kun khyab*

Kong sprul Blo gros mtha' yas (1813–1899), *Shes bya ba kun khyab*. Ed. L. Chandra, New Delhi, 1970.

Lo dgon - 'Od stong

Lo dgon pa bSod nams lha'i dbang po (1423–1496), *bKa' gdams rin po che'i chos 'byung rnam thar nyin mor byed pa'i 'od stong*. Crit. ed. in [Vetturini 2007](#): Part 2.

Moriyama 2001

Seitetsu Moriyama, “Chibetto bukkyō: Phywa-pa Chos-kyi-seng-ge oyobi dGe-lugs-pa no nitaisetsu no kaishaku” [チベット仏教: チャパチューキセンゲ及びゲルク派の二諦説の解釈] {*The Interpretation of the Two Truths Doctrine of Phywa-pa Chos-kyi-seng-ge and dGe-lugs-pa}, *Kotengaku no saikōchiku*. Daiikki kenkyūseika hōkoku [古典学の再構築: 第一期研究成果報告], 78–85.

Moriyama 2010

Seitetsu Moriyama, “The Relationship Between the Two Truths, *bDen pa gnyis*, According to Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge, and the Influence of His Interpretation on the dGe lugs pa Tradition,” in *Studies in the Philosophy and History of Tibet [PIATS 2006: Proceedings of the Eleventh Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies. Königswinter 2006]*, Maret Kark and Horst Lasic (ed.). Halle: International Institute for Tibetan and Buddhist Studies GmbH, 131–143.

Nemoto 2008

Hiroshi Nemoto, “チベット中觀思想における時間論の展開---「刹那」の概念を中心に” [“Skad cig ma: The Problem of Time in Tibetan Madhyamaka Exegesis”], *Report of the Japanese Association for Tibetan Studies* (『日本西蔵学会々報』) 54, 3–15. (<http://ci.nii.ac.jp/naid/110009841248>)

Nemoto 2011

Hiroshi Nemoto, ゲルク派における時間論の研究 [A Study of the dGe lugs pa's View of Time], Kyoto: Heirakuji-shoten.

Nemoto 2013

Hiroshi Nemoto, “Who is a Proper Opponent? The Tibetan Buddhist Concept of *phyi rgol yang dag*,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 41, 151–165.

Nishizawa 2010

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「チャパ・チューキセンゲの認識手段論 — 認識手段の定義をめぐって —」 (In Japanese) [“The pramāṇa Theory of Phya pa chos kyi seng ge— With Reference to his Interpretation of the Definition of Pramāṇa”], *Report of the Japanese Association for Tibetan Studies* (『日本西蔵学会々報』) 56, 61–75.

Nishizawa 2011a

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「チャパ・チューキセンゲのゴク翻訳官批判 — 認識手段性の確定をめぐる —」 (In Japanese) ["Phya pa chos kyi seng ge's Criticism of rNgog Blo ldan shes rab: On the ascertainment of *prāmāṇya*"], *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies (Indogaku Bukkyogaku Kenkyu* 『印仏研』) 59.2, 76–79 = (999)–(996).

Nishizawa 2011b - unpublished doctoral thesis

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「チベット仏教論理学の形成と展開 — 認識手段論の歴史的変遷を中心として —」, 全四巻, 東京大学, 2011. [=博士学位論文] [The Formation and Development of Tibetan Buddhist Logic — With Reference to the Historical transition of Pramāṇa Theory —. 4 vols., University of Tokyo, 2011].

Nishizawa 2012a

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「『論理学意圖拈拭』におけるチャパの思想的立場」 (In Japanese) ["The Philosophical Standpoint of Phya pa chos kyi seng ge"], *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies (Indogaku Bukkyogaku Kenkyu* 『印仏研』) 60.2, 1062–1059.

Nishizawa 2012b

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「サンブ教学の歴史的展開に関する一考察」 (In Japanese) ["A Brief Survey on the Historical Development of the gSang phu Scholasticism"], *Report of the Japanese Association for Tibetan Studies* 『日本西藏学会々報』 58, 1–14.

Nishizawa 2012c

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「チベット仏教論理学における<理解 (rtogs pa)>の概念について」 (In Japanese) ["On the Concept of "Understanding" (rtogs pa) in the Tibetan Buddhist Logic."], *Indian Logic* 『インド論理学研究』 4, 97–122.

Nishizawa 2013a

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「チャパ・チューキセンゲの教義書」 ["The Grub mtha' Literature of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge"], *Report of the Japanese Association for Tibetan Studies* (『日本西藏学会々報』) 59, 67–84.

Nishizawa 2013b

Fumihito Nishizawa, "gSang phu ne'u thog — Its Contribution to the Re-establishment and Development of Tibetan Buddhism in the Later Diffusion (*phyi dar*) period." In: *Current Issues and Progress in Tibetan Studies: Proceedings of the Third International Seminar of Young Tibetologists, Kobe 2012*. Tsuguhito Takeuchi, Kazushi Iwao, Ai Nishida, Seiji Kumagai, Meishi Yamamoto (eds.), *Journal of the Research Institute of Foreign Studies* 51, Kobe City University of Foreign Studies, 343–366.

Nishizawa 2013c

Fumihito Nishizawa, "A Reconsideration of *pratyakṣa* and *niścaya*: Dharmakīrti's Inconsistent Accounts and the Interpretations of Śākyabuddhi and Arcaṭa" (in Japanese), *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies (Indogaku bukkyogaku kenkyū)* 61.3, 115–120.

Nishizawa 2014

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「チベットにおける他者排除 (anyāpoha) 論の形成と展開 —11-12 世紀サンブ系論理学の伝承を中心として —」 (In Japanese) ["The Formation and Development of Anyāpoha Theory in Tibet: With Reference to the gSang phu Scholastic Tradition of Pramāṇa in the 11th to 12th Centuries"], *Indian Logic* 『Indo ronrigaku kenkyū, インド論理学研究』 VII, 227–282.

Nishizawa 2015

Fumihito Nishizawa, 「ダルモータラの直接知覚論」 (In Japanese) ["Dharmottara's Theory of *pratyakṣa* -- Its Originality and Theoretical Background"], *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 63.2, 90–95.

Nishizawa 2016a

Fumihito Nishizawa, “チャパ・チューキセンゲの直接知覚論” (In Japanese) ["Phya pa chos kyi seng ge's Theory of *pratyakṣa* -- Focused on the Relationship between *pratyakṣa* and *niścaya*."], *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 64.2, 71–75 [1972–1968].

Nishizawa 2016b

Fumihito Nishizawa, “A Reconsideration of perception and Object-Ascertaining Cognition: Dharmakīrti's Inconsistent Accounts and the Interpretations of His Followers in India and Tibet.” *Indian Logic (Indo ronrigaku kenkyū, インド論理学研究)* IX, 145–164.

Nishizawa 2017

Fumihito Nishizawa, “チャパ・チューキセンゲの中観思想：その独自性と思想的背景” (In Japanese) ["Madhyamaka Thought of Phya pa chos kyi seng ge : Its Originality and Theoretical Background"]. *日本西蔵學會々報* 62: 25–39.

Nishizawa 2018

Fumihito Nishizawa, “チベット初期中観思想における空性理解：ゴク翻訳師, トルンパ, ギヤマルワ, チャパ,” (In Japanese) ["On the Interpretations of Emptiness (*śūnyatā*) in the Early Tibetan Madhyamaka Thought : rNgog lo tsa ba, Gro lung pa, rGya dmar ba and Phya pa"], *日本西蔵學會々報* 64: 35–51.

Nishizawa 2019

Fumihito Nishizawa, “チベット初期中観思想における二諦説 —トルンパとギヤマルワの二諦を巡る論争—” (In Japanese) ["The Two-truths (*Satyadvaya*) Theory of the Early Tibetan Madhyamaka Thought —Controversies between Gro lung pa and rGya dmar ba on the Two-truths Theory"] *Annual Memoirs of the Otani University Shin Buddhist Comprehensive Research Institute* 36: 1–204.

Onoda 1986

Shunzō Onoda, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's Classifications of Thal 'gyur,” *Berliner Indologische Studien* 2, 65–85.

Onoda 1989

Shunzō Onoda, “The Chronology of the Abbatial Successions of the gSang phu sNe'u thog Monastery,” *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens* 33, 203–213.

Onoda 1992

Shunzō Onoda, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's Theory of 'gal ba,” in *Buddhist Philosophy and Literature: Tibetan Studies: Proceedings of the 5th Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, Narita 1989* (Vol. 1). Zuihō Yamaguchi and Shōren Ihara (ed.). Narita: Naritasan Shinshoji, 197–202.

Padma – Chos 'byung

Padma dkar po (b. 1527), *Chos 'byung bstan pa'i padma rgyas pa'i nyin byed*, Collected Works, Vol. 2, Darjeeling, 1973.

dPa' – dGa' ston

dPa' bo gtsug lag phreng ba (ca. 1504–1566), *mKhas pa'i dga'ston*, Vols. 1–4. Ed. L. Chandra, New Delhi, 1960–1961.

dPa' – Chos 'byung

dPa' bo gtsug lag phreng ba (ca. 1504–1566), *Chos 'byung mkhas pa'i dga'ston*. Ed. Lho brag, vol. 1, New Delhi, 1980.

Roerich 1949–1953

George Roerich, *The Blue Annals*, Vols I&II, Calcutta.

gSer mdog Paṅ chen – rNgog lo rol mo

gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan (1428-1507), *rNgog lo tstsha ba chen pos bstan pa ji ltar bskyangs pa'i tshul mdo tsam du bya ba ngo mtshar gtam gyi rol mo*, Collected Works (*The Complete Works (gSung 'bum) of gSer mdog paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan*). Ed. Kunzang Tobgey, Timphu, 1975 [Reprint Nagwang Topgyal, Delhi, 1988]), Vol. 16, 443–456.

gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dGa' byed

gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan (1428-1507), *Tshad ma'i mdo dang bstan bcos kyī shing rta'i srol rnam ji ltar byung ba'i tshul gtam bya ba nyin mor byed pa'i snang bas dpyod ldan mtha' dag dga' bar byed pa*, Collected Works (*The Complete Works (gSung 'bum) of gSer mdog paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan*). Ed. Kunzang Tobgey, Timphu, 1975 [Reprint Nagwang Topgyal, Delhi, 1988]), Vol. 19.

gSer mdog Paṅ chen – Theg chen rgya mtsho

gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan (1428-1507), *Theg pa chen po dbu ma rnam par nges pa'i bang mdzod lung rigs rgya mtsho*, Collected Works (*The Complete Works (gSung 'bum) of gSer mdog paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan*). Ed. Kunzang Tobgey, Timphu, 1975 [Reprint Nagwang Topgyal, Delhi, 1988]), Vols. 14-15.

gSer mdog Paṅ chen - dBu ma'i byung tshul

gSer mdog Paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan (1428-1507), *dBu ma'i byung tshul rnam par bshad pa'i gtam yid bzhin lhun po*, Collected Works (*The Complete Works (gSung 'bum) of gSer mdog paṅ chen Śākya mchog ldan*). Ed. Kunzang Tobgey, Timphu, 1975 [Reprint Nagwang Topgyal, Delhi, 1988]), Vol. 4, 209–248.

Seyfort Ruegg 2000

David Seyfort Ruegg, *Three Studies in the History of Indian and Tibetan Madhyamaka Philosophy*, Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien – Universität Wien (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 50).

bSod nams rtse mo – bsTod pa

bSod nams rtse mo (1142–1182), *Slob dpon phyā pa'i bstod pa*, Sa skya pa'i bka' 'bum, Vol. 2, Tokyo, 1968, 39/4/4–41/3/1.

Sørensen&Hazod 2007

Per K. Sørensen and Guntram Hazod, in cooperation with Tsering Gyalbo, *Rulers on the Celestial Plain*, Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (Veröffentlichungen zur Sozialanthropologie 10).

Stoltz 2007

Jonathan Stoltz, "Gettier and Factivity in Indo-Tibetan Epistemology," *The Philosophical Quarterly* 57.228, 394–415.

Stoltz 2009

Jonathan Stoltz, “Phywa Pa’s Argumentative Analogy Between Factive Assessment (*Yid Dpyod*) and Conceptual Thought (*Rtog pa*),” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 32, 369–386.

Stoltz 2014

Jonathan Stoltz, “Cognition, Phenomenal Character, and Intentionality in Tibetan Buddhism.” In *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, first ed. Ed. by. Steven Emmanuel. John Wiley&Sons, Inc., 405–418.

Stoltz 2021

Jonathan Stoltz, *Illuminating the Mind: An Introduction to Buddhist Epistemology*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2021.

Tauscher 1999

Helmut Tauscher, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge’s Opinion on *prasaṅga*,” in *Dharmakīrti’s Thought and Its Impact on Indian and Tibetan Philosophy. Proceedings of the Third International Dharmakīrti Conference, Hiroshima, November 4-6, 1997*. Vienne : Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 387–393.

Tauscher 1999 (ed.)

Helmut Tauscher, *Phya pa Chos kyi sen ge, dBu ma śar gsum gyi ston thun*, Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien – Universität Wien (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 43).

Tauscher 2003

Helmut Tauscher, “Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge as a Svātantrika,” *The Svātantrika-Prāsaṅgika Distinction. What difference does a difference make?* Georges Dreyfus and Sara L. McClintock (ed.). Boston: Wisdom Publications (Studies in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism), 207–255.

Tauscher 2009–2010

Helmut Tauscher, “Remarks on Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge and his Madhyamaka Treatises,” *The Tibet Journal* 34.3–4 and 35.1–2, 1–35.

Thu’u bkwan - *Shel gyi me long*

Thu’u bkwan Blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, *Grub mtha’ thams cad kyi khungs dang ’dod tshul ston pa legs bshad shel gyi me long*, Collected Works, Vol. 2. Ed. Ngawang Gelek Demo, New Delhi, 1969.

Tucci 1949

Giuseppe Tucci, *Tibetan Painted Scrolls*, Rome.

van der Kuijp 1978

Leonard van der Kuijp, “Phya-pa Chos-kyi seng-ge’s Impact on Tibetan Epistemological Theory,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 5, 355–369.

van der Kuijp 1983

Leonard van der Kuijp, *Contributions to the Development of Tibetan Buddhist Epistemology*, Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

van der Kuijp 1987

Leonard van der Kuijp, “The Monastery of Gsang-phu ne’u-thog and Its Abbatial Succession from ca. 1073 to 1250,” *Berliner indologische Studien* 3, 103–127.

van der Kuijp 1993

Leonard van der Kuijp, “Jayānanda. A Twelfth Century *Guoshi* from Kashmir Among the Tangut,” *Central Asiatic Journal* 37.3-4, 188-197.

van der Kuijp 2003

Leonard van der Kuijp, "A Treatise on Buddhist Epistemology and Logic Attributed to Klong chen Rab 'byams pa (1308–1364) and Its Place in Indo-Tibetan Intellectual History," *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 31, 381–437.

van der Kuijp 2016

Leonard W.J. van der Kuijp, "The Lives of Bu ston Rin chen grub and the Date and Sources of His *Chos 'byung*, a Chronicle of Buddhism in India and Tibet", *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines*, no. 35, April 2016, 203–308.

Vetturini 2007

Gianpaolo Vetturini, *The bKa' gdams pa School of Tibetan Buddhism*. [Revised version of the Ph.D. thesis accepted in 2007 at SOAS, University of London].
http://himalaya.socanth.cam.ac.uk/collections/rarebooks/downloads/Gianpaolo_Vetturini_PhD.pdf.

Vose 2009

Kevin Vose, *Resurrecting Candrakīrti: Disputes in the Tibetan Creation of Prāsaṅgika*. Boston: Wisdom Publications (Studies in Indian and Tibetan Buddhism).

Vose 2015

Kevin Vose, "Do Mādhyamikas See What the Rest of Us See? Early bKa' gdams pas on "Commonly Appearing Subjects" (*chos can mthun snang ba*)," *Journal of Buddhist Philosophy* 1, 95–135.

Wangchuk 2017

Tsering Wangchuk, *The Uttaratantra in the Land of Snows – Tibetan Thinkers Debate the Centrality of the Buddha-Nature Treatise*. Albany: SUNY Press.

Werner 2014

Eric Werner, *Phywa-pa Chos-kyi-seng-ge's (1109–1169) Depiction of Māhāyāna Philosophy – A Critical Edition and Annotated Translation of the Chapters on Yogācāra and Mādhyamaka Philosophy from the gZhung lugs rnam 'byed, a Doxography of the Twelfth Century*.
Wissenschaftliche Hausarbeit zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades Master of Arts der Universität Hamburg (=MA thesis), unpublished.

Ye shes rgyal mtshan - *Se spyil bu ba'i rnam thar*

Ye shes rgyal mtshan, *Se pyil bu ba'i rnam thar*. In *Lam rim bla ma brgyud pa'i rnam thar*, Lhasa, 1990: Bod ljongs mi dmangs dpe skrun khang (BDRC W1CZ2730), vol. 1, 272–275.