

1_009_01_i_Phya pa_grub mtha'

Last update: 16.04.2021

1. Titles

Editorial title:

bde bar gshegs pa dang phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnam par 'byed pa

Short title:

grub mtha'

Title in *KDSB dkar chag*:

bde bar gshegs pa dang phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnam par 'byed pa (Introduction, p. 18, 61)

Text name as attested in the exemplar:

- bde bar gshegs pa dang ; phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnaM par 'byed pa (f. 1a, cover page)
- bde bar gshegs pa dang phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnam par 'byed pa (f. 33b1, colophon, and colophons of systems 1 (f. 8b2), 5 (f. 19b1) and 6 (f. 33a5))
- bde bar gshegs pa dang phyi rol pa'i gzhung rnam par dbye ba (colophons of systems 2 (f. 13b1), 3 (f. 14b7) and 4 (f. 17a4))

English title:

Distinguishing the scriptural systems of the Buddhists and the non-Buddhists

2. Author

Identification:

Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge (1109–1169)

BDRC ID author:

P1404

As attested in the exemplar:

- dge slong chos kyi seng ge (f. 33b2, colophon)

3. Work description

Affiliation:

bKa' gdams pa

Addressee of the invocation:

'phags pa 'jam dpal gzhon nur gyur pa

Genre:

Doxography

Topic:

Buddhist and non-Buddhist philosophical schools

General text description:

Doxographical presentation of non-Buddhist and Buddhist philosophical schools drawing information from the *Tarkajvāla*, *Prajñāpradīpaṭīkā*, *Tattvasaṃgraha* (and *°pañjikā*) and *Madhyamakāvatāra*, with summarized refutation of each of the non-Buddhist systems and of some of the Buddhist systems, and

rejection of objections against Madhyamaka. Includes extensive quotes for non-Buddhist systems, and a few citations in the section on Buddhist schools (from the *Abhidharmakośa*, *Madhyamakālaṃkāra*, *Pramāṇavārttika*, *Trimśikā*, *Mahāyānasamgraha* and *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra*; see Werner 2014: 24–25 for the details). The section of Madhyamka does not mention the division between svātantrika and prāsaṅgika, but only dwelves on the division between the non-abiding view and illusionist view with regard to ultimate reality, while on the conventional level, he refutes madhyamka adopting a system akin to yogācāra and to sautrāntika.

The structure of the text does not follow a strict *sa bcad* hierarchy (as found in Phya pa's other works). A six-fold division (not referred to as “chapters”) structures the six systems that Phya pa distinguishes – 5 non-Buddhists (vaiṣṇava, śaiva, jaina, sāmkhya, cārvaka) and the Buddhists (see Werner 2014: 22). This doxography was reported by ‘Gos lo tsā ba in the *Deb ther sngon po* (as *phyi nang gi grub mtha'*) and by A khu ching in the *Tho yig* (no. 11910: *phyi nang gi grub mtha' i rnam bzhag bsdus pa*) (Werner 2014: 21). Werner points out multiple re-use of Phya pa's doxography in Klong chen pa's *Grub mtha' mdzod*.

Table of Contents / Outline

- Cover page (1a)
- Incipit (1b1)
- Invocation (1b1)
- Introductory verses (1b1–1b4)
- Body of the text (1b3–33a2)
 - 1. *phyi rol pa'i grub mtha'* (1b3–19b2)
 - 11. *khyab 'jug pa* (2a5–8b2)
 - 111. *rig byed kyi mtha' gsang par smra ba* (2b5–5a4)
 - 112. *spyod pa ba* (5a4–8b2)
 - 12. *dbang phyug pa* (8b2–13b2)
 - 121. *bye brag pa* (9b5–12b6)
 - 122. *rigs pa can* (12b6–13a1)
 - 13. *nam mkha' gos can rgyal ba can* (13b2–15a1)
 - 14. *grangs can pa* (15a1–17a5)
 - 15. *tshu rol mdzes pa* (17a5–19b1)
 - 2. *bde bar gshegs pa nang pa'i grub mtha'* (19b2–33a2)
 - 21. [the*g dman*] (19b2–24a1)
 - 211. *gnas ma bu sde ba'i lugs* (19b2–20a1)
 - 212. *bye brag tu smra ba* (20a1–22a7)
 - 213. *mdo sde pa* (22b1–24a1)
 - 22. *theg pa chen po* (24a1–33a2)
 - 221. *sems tsam pa* (24a1–29a5)
 - 222. *ngo bo nyid med par smra ba* (29a5–33a2)
- Conclusive verses (33a2–33a5)
- Colophon (33a5–33b3)
- Post-colophon note 1 (33b3–33b8)
- Post-colophon note 2

See also the outline in Werner 2014: 23, and Nishizawa 2013: 69-71 for a synoptic table in Japanese

4. Exemplar

4.1 Source

In *KDSB*:

Set 1, vol. 9, pp. 7–72

BDRC ID:

W1PD89051

Origin:

bKra shis dbang rgyal (*KDSB dkar chag* 1, Introduction, p. 61: “spo mi spyan drug lung du gnas dod bkra shis dbang rgyal nas mkho ’don gnang ba”) (see Werner 2014: n. 90 on this location, which he associates with sPo bo/sPo mi and the monastery of sPo bo chos sde, where several works included in the KDSB were found)

4.2 Extent

Number of folios (in the KDSB/in the original):

33/33

Extent (first and last folio):

1–33

Lines per folio:

7, 6 on f. 33a

Remarks:

Text on 1b1–33b7

Folio number on cover page: *gcig*

Folio number on last folio (33a): *so 3 bzhugs so*

4.3 Manuscript particularities

Size (according to the catalogue):

?

Type:

Handwritten

Script:

dpe tshugs

Orthography:

- Abbreviations (e.g., for *ye shes*, *thams cad*, final –gs, etc.)
- Bindu for *m*

Left and right margins:

-

Annotations:

-

Symbols:

3 *siddham* signs at the beginning of the text; 2 *siddham* signs on the recto of the other folios

5. Literature

5.1 Text and edition(s)

(a) *Exemplar*

- KDSB 1, vol. 9, pp. 7–72 (facsimile)
- BDRC **O1PD89051C2O0101** (PDF copy of the KDSB images)

(b) *Other exemplar(s)*

-

(c) *Edition(s)*

- Werner 2014: 92–117 (crit. ed. of the *yogācāra* and *madhyamaka* chapters)
- Hugon 2016b (crit. ed. of f. 29b3–30a6)

- Almogi 2010: 195–197 (crit ed. of f. 30a6–31a2)

5.2 Translations and studies

- Werner 2014 (Phya pa's depiction of mahāyāna philosophy in this work)
- Werner 2014: 42–88 (English transl. of yogācāra and madhyamaka chapters)
- Hugon 2016b (English transl. of f. 29b3–30a6)
- Almogi 2010: 166-168 (English transl. of f. 30a6–31a2)
- Nishizawa 2013: 69-71 (synoptic table, in Japanese); 68 (translation of colophon)
- Werner 2014: 23 (synoptic table)
- Werner 2014: 29&36 (detailed outline of yogācāra and madhyamaka chapters)