

***Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya, Chapters 1 and 2. Critically  
edited 2007 (STTAR 2): Further and Last Corrigenda and  
Addenda***

**(November 2018)**

by

Ernst Steinkellner, Vienna

There are various reasons for presenting the following additional list of corrigenda and addenda. Among them are a few more misprints and mistakes having been found, as well as new proposals of conjectures subsequent to the edition of *Pramāṇaviniścaya* 1 and 2, of which some already received corrigenda in Steinkellner 2008 and 2013a that are not repeated here. But, above all, they are due to the surprising landing in my lap of photos of a new manuscript of all three chapters,<sup>1</sup> nearly complete except for a few small gaps and one larger one.

**The new manuscript F**

These photos are evidently from the Drepung volumes of the digital and still officially unavailable “publication” of all manuscripts extant in the TAR. In this publication, the photos are arranged on plates of four folio pages, these identified with data-numbers 035 – 109. On the left side of the photos are sigla related to the recto and verso pages of the folios, e.g., 1A, 1B, etc. A survey of the correct sequence of these photos including the gaps is appended here. The present remarks are limited to chapters 1 and 2; chapter 3 will be dealt with by Pascale Hugon.

The photos are of a palm leaf manuscript. The leaves are generally readable, but many are slightly faded, even occasionally considerably faded, in all probability due to humidity. Chapter 1 is contained in 15 folios plus four lines of a single folio page. It is thus almost complete, with only 2 folios lacking. Chapter 2 follows immediately, but only 17 folios are preserved. Of it, altogether 9 folios are lacking.

The script is Proto-Bengālī or, as I would like to name it, Vihārī, flat-topped, clear, and upright with regular lines. It most resembles the script of Ms B of PVin 1-2. The

---

<sup>1</sup> On this manuscript, cf. Steinkellner forthcoming. The photos will be presented on the website of the Institute for the Cultural and Intellectual History of Asia (IKGA) of the Austrian Academy of Sciences at the time of the publication of this contribution to the Festschrift for John Taber.

seemingly original pagination is found on the left margin with sometimes faded figure numerals, and it continues through all three chapters.

The square blank space for the binding hole is to the left of the center from the second to the fifth line. The pages bear six lines with approximately 60 – 67 *akṣara* in complete lines. The manuscript's actual measurements are not yet known.

Beginning: *ś namo buddhāya // sa śrīmān alalaṅkadhīh ....*

Chapter colophons:

071, 75B, 1.4: *.....sūcita..eveti // pramā.....ścaye pratyakṣaparicchedaḥ prathamah // //*

078, 92A, 1.6: *...uktaḥ / pramāṅaviniścaye svārthānumānaparicchedo dvitīyah /*

### **Scribal mistakes, peculiarities, and variants**

Gemination of consonants occurs, mostly after *-r*, as does degemination of consonants, mostly before *-v*, but not regularly. Homorganic nasal for *anusvāra* or the reverse are used at will. *avagraha* is often used, but not consistently. *sandhi* is irregularly applied; often initial *a-* or *ā-* are written after vowels.

Corrections occur as a single stroke above an *akṣara* or a vowel-sign, and there are also a few insertions in the margins.

Conspicuous is the absence of the expected *daṅḍas*, even in the case of *kārikās* interspersed in the running text. It is this lack of *daṅḍas* that also causes sometimes unexpected *sandhis*. Altogether, the manuscript gives the impression of having been written by dictation, not an exemplar having been visually copied. This assumption may also be supported by the fact that the usual visual mistakes, such as confusion of *ba* and *va*, *ya* and *pa*, *bha* and *ta*, *va* and *ca* or *na*, seem rarely to occur.

Since such individual scribal phenomena were not reported in the 2007 edition, I shall report here only the occasional real deviations, as well as those that may be taken as substantial variants. In cases in which F agrees with the preferred reading, this is not additionally reported. F's readings are also not reported when they are the same as a reading that was rejected.

For additional remarks on the manuscripts A, B, C, D, E, N, and PVinṬ, cf. Hugon & Tomabechi 2011: xv–xx. They also provided a substantial survey of the relationship between the manuscripts and the exemplars used by the Tibetan translation and by Dharmottara for his commentary (*ibid.*: xxiv–xxviii). I can, however, not dabble again with the issue of the relationships between these manuscripts.

## Corrigenda

(Signs and abbreviations: > change to, → until, add. = to be added, del. = to be deleted, A. = Apparatus, em. = emended, conj. = conjectured, om. = omitted)

xxi,11f: Proto-Bengali script, hook-topped, > Hook-topped Nepalese (Hugon & Tomabechi 2011: xvii)

xxii,11f: *tshad ma'i bstan bcos gś.. dañ ..d (nas ma) tshañ ba / > tshad ma'i bstan bcos gśam cuñ zad nas ma tshañ ba /* (“A treatise on epistemology, of which the end is somewhat incomplete”, Hugon & Tomabechi 2011, xvii)

## Chapter 1

2,11: yathāvidhaḥ\* > yathāvidhe\*

2, A.2,4f: yathāvidha<ḥ> em. : → AB > yathāvidhe ABF : yathāvidha C

3,3: yatprāgdr̥ṣṭam\* > yatra prāg dr̥ṣṭās

3,9: <sup>x</sup>tadbhāvānu° > <sup>x,x</sup>tadbhāvānu°

3,11: °prasaṅgāt > °prasaṅgāt<sup>x</sup>

3, A.1,3: <sup>x'-x'</sup> **Ci'e** PST 2. 125,2-8

3, A.1,4: PST 2.B99b5f > PST 2. 131,7-10

3, A.2,2: dr̥ṣṭam em. : → ABC > del.

7,7: tayā rahitam\* / > del.

7, A.2,1f: <tayā rahitam> em. : → om. ABC > del.<sup>2</sup>

8, A.2,2: tadvaśena B > tadvaśena BF

8, A.2,4: <sup>11f</sup> sambhavati AC : bhavati BF > add.

9,7: arthasya → anupayogāt > <sup>k</sup>arthasya → anupayogāt<sup>k</sup>

9,9: avikalpakam > avikalpakam\*

---

<sup>2</sup> Also om. in F. With Elliot Stern (e-mail 21.4.2008) I now consider it as a gloss in T introduced from Nyāyabindu 1.6.

9, A.1,2: <sup>k'-k'</sup>NBhūṣ 182,24 > add.

9, A.2,2: <sup>9</sup> avikalpakam AC : avikalpakam BF

10,1: <sup>o</sup>jāti<sup>o</sup> > <sup>o,o'</sup>o'jāti<sup>o</sup>

10,2: <sup>o</sup>yogāt > <sup>o</sup>yogāt<sup>o</sup>

10, A.1,1: <sup>o'-o'</sup>NBhūṣ 183,10f > add.

11, A.2,2: samagrasāmagrīkasya ABC > samagrasāmagrīkasya ABCF

12,2: iti pratipannapratyakṣṭ<sup>7</sup>\*bhavitum > iti pratipadan na\* pratyakṣṭbhavitum

12,3: dravyam > <sup>y'</sup>dravyam

yadi > yadi<sup>y'</sup>

12,6: tathāsamanvā<sup>b</sup>hāre > <sup>b</sup>tathāsamanvāhāre

12, A.2,1: <sup>y'-y'</sup>NBhūṣ 155,7 > add.

12, A.2,1-3: <sup>1f</sup> de'i phyr → arhati > del.

12, A.2,4: pratipanna<sup>o</sup> > <sup>2</sup>pratipa<da>n na <sup>em.</sup> (Motoi Ono, email 9.8.2013)

14,5: alakṣitāḥ > anupalakṣitāḥ

14, A.2,3: <sup>5</sup>anupalakṣitāḥ A<sup>3</sup> : alakṣitāḥ BCF > add.

15,1: upayannāpayamś\* ca\* > upapann apayamś ca

15,7: caiṣām\* > cainām (Motoi Ono, email 9.8.2013)

15, A.2,1f: skye ba dañ → ca > del.

15, A.2,2f: upayannāpayamś <sup>em.</sup> : upayannapayamś ABC > upapann apayamś ABCF

15, A.2,5f: caiṣām <sup>em.</sup> : cainām ABC > del.

19, A.1,6: <sup>w-w</sup>SDS 14,21f; > <sup>w-w</sup>SDS 14,21f; NPT 29,15f; ŚD 149,12f; ĪPVV II 159,6f;

20,3: <sup>x</sup>niṣpādita<sup>o</sup> > <sup>x,x'</sup>niṣpādita<sup>o</sup>

20,4: atipatati > atipatati<sup>x'</sup>

20, A.1,1: <sup>x'-x'</sup>AAĀ 2,8f > add.

20, A.2,3: <sup>10</sup>sarvajñānānām AC : sarveṣām eva vijñānānām BF > add.

21,6: tesām → anuṣaṅgiṇī<sup>g</sup> > <sup>i</sup>teṣām → anuṣaṅgiṇī<sup>g,i'</sup>

<sup>3</sup> And all testimonies. Cf. Pecchia 2014: 117-118.

21,11: <sup>k</sup>tadatad<sup>o</sup> → <sup>o</sup>hetujāḥ > <sup>k,k'</sup>tadatad<sup>o</sup> → <sup>o</sup>hetujāḥ<sup>k'</sup>

21, A.1,1: <sup>i-i'</sup>ŚVT 258,16 > add.

23, A.2,2: yad viṣayā<sup>o</sup> ABC : yad viṣayā<sup>o</sup> ABCF

28, A.1,1: 29,3; > 29,3; AAĀ 4,26f; 270,3f

29, A.1,3: 441,5 > 441,5; AAĀ 158,16; 342,30

30,5f: eveti\* karaṇa<sup>o\*</sup> > evetikaraṇa<sup>o\*</sup>

30, A.2,3f: iti n.e. T → <sup>6</sup>karaṇa<sup>o</sup> n.e. T > itikaraṇa<sup>o</sup> n.e.T

37,3: aindriyaka<sup>o</sup> → <sup>o</sup>sukhasyo<sup>o</sup> > <sup>m'</sup>aindriyaka<sup>o</sup> → <sup>o</sup>sukhasyo<sup>om'</sup>

37, A.1,1: <sup>m'-m'</sup>Ci PVA 305,18f > add.

38, A.1,1: <sup>u-u</sup>294,6f > 294,6f; NBhūṣ 57,6f; NPT 20,10f

40, A.1,6: NR 216,5f > NR 216,5f; AAĀ 316,10

43,3: <sup>o</sup>tadvidoḥ > <sup>o</sup>taddhiyoḥ

43, A.2,1: <sup>3</sup><sup>o</sup>vidoḥ AC : <sup>o</sup>viptoḥ B > <sup>o</sup>dhiyoḥ BF : <sup>o</sup>vidoḥ AC

## Chapter 2

45,5f: kvacid adṛṣṭam > kvacid dṛṣṭam

45,8: gamakadharmā<sup>o</sup> > gamakadharmā<sup>o\*</sup>

45, A.1,3: PST 2.B53b2-5 > PST 2. 1,5-12

45, A.2,4: <sup>8</sup>gamakadharmā<sup>o</sup> AC : gamakalakṣaṇā<sup>o</sup> BF > add.

47,2: pratyakṣeṇā<sup>o</sup> > pratyakṣeṇā<sup>o</sup>

48,5: na vyavasānitayā > na tu\* vyavasānitayā

48, A.2,5: <sup>5</sup>na tu vyavasānitayā BCF : na vyavasānitayā A > add.

49, A.1,1: PVSVT 19,23f; > PVSVT 19,23f; 99,3f;

50, A.1,3: PST 2.B65b5-6 > PST 2. 35,6-7

53, A.1,3: PST 2.B66b1 > PST 2. 37,4f

57,5: svabhāva<sup>o\*</sup> > sabhāva<sup>o\*</sup>

57,11: kārya<sup>o</sup> > <sup>u'</sup>kārya<sup>o</sup>

57, A.2,3: <sup>5</sup> mthun phyogs for svabhāva > <sup>5</sup> sabhāva<sup>o</sup> conj. (mthun phyogs T) : svabhāva<sup>o4</sup>

58, A.1,1: <sup>x-x</sup> Ce'e > <sup>x-x</sup> Ci'e

60,4: apratiṣedho > apratiṣedhaḥ /\*

60, A.2,3: apratiṣedhaḥ / BCF : apratiṣedho A > add.

63,9: antyakṣaṇe 'prati\*bandhaḥ > antyakṣaṇo 'pratibandhaḥ

63, A.2,2f: antyakṣaṇe → aprati<sup>o</sup> B > del.

65,6: tānśāstram > tān śāstram

65, A.2,3: 'vyavasātuḥ BC : vyavaśāntaḥ A > 'vyavasātuḥ B : 'dhyavasātuḥ CF :  
vyavaśāntuḥ A

69, A.2,3f: svahetu{kṛ}kṛter A : svahetuprakṛter B (raṅ gi → yin pas T) >  
svahetuprakṛter BC (raṅ gi → yin pas T) : svahetu{kṛ}kṛter A

81,8: hetusattve > hetumattve\*

81, A.2,6: <sup>o</sup> hetumattve ABC (PVinṬ 2. 93b5) : rgyu yod pa ñid yin na T (~  
hetusattve) > add.

82,3: 'pratibandhinī\* cet > 'pratibandhinīti cet

82, A.2,1f: <sup>o</sup>bandhinī A : <sup>o</sup>bandhinīti BC > del.

82, A.2,3: kṣaṇas'āstathāyī A > kṣaṇamātrasthāyī A

83,5: apekṣata > apekṣyata\*

83, A.2,2: <sup>5</sup> apekṣyata em. (Itos par bya ba T, PVSV) : apekṣata ABCF

84, A.2,3: tadā n.e. T > tadā om. F, n.e. T

85,4: gamyate > gamyate\*

85, A.2,1: gamyate ABF : avagamyate C

85, A.2,2: tatkāryaḥ C > tatkāryaḥ A

85, A.2,2: kāryaḥ AB > kāryaḥ BCF (PVSV)

85, A.2,3: akāryaḥ AC > asaty apy ABF : apy asaty C <sup>o</sup> akāryaḥ AC

86,7: ahetutva<sup>o</sup> > ahetukatva<sup>o\*</sup>

86, A.2,2: <sup>7</sup> ahetukatva<sup>o</sup> BF : ahetutva<sup>o</sup> AC > add.

---

<sup>4</sup> See Steinkellner 2013, II. note 395 for this conjecture.

88, A.1,1: em. (PVSV) > F (PVSV)

89,13: na hi > °na hi

89,14: °ayaṃ\* > ayaṃ\*

90,1: °siddhiḥ\*° > °siddhiḥ\*

90,2: syāt > syāt°

## Sources

105: AAĀ Abhisamayālaṅkāraloka (Haribhadra) – *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā Haribhadraviracitayā Ālokākhyāvyaḥyayā sahitā*. Ed. P. L. Vaidya. (BST 4) Darbhanga 1960.

110,6: *Śrīmadācāra-* > *Śrīmadācārya-*

## pāda Index

129: apīṣṭo ... 2.21d > 138: so 'pīṣṭo ... 2.21d

130: -artho bhinna ekas ... 2.27b > 135: bhinna ekas ... 2.27b

'hetor anyānapekṣaṇāt 2.58b

131: grāhyaṃ ... 2.43b > 132: tadgrāhyaṃ ... 2.43b

132: tatphalo 'tatphalaś ca 2.27a > tatphalo 'tatphalaś cārtho 2.27a

\*tadātmyād arthasaṃvitteḥ 1.41c<sup>?</sup> (cf. 37, A.2, note 7) > add.

tadgrāhyaṃ laukikaṃ yadi 2.43b > add.

133: na yuktibādhā yatrāsti tat 2.43a > na yuktibādhā yatrāsti 2.43a

135: bhinna ekas tatas tataḥ 2.27b > add.

137: śabdapravṛtter astīti saḥ 2.21c > śabdapravṛtter astīti 2.21c

138: so 'pīṣṭo vyavahārabhāk 2.21d > add.

\*svasaṃvit phalam ucyate 1.41d<sup>?</sup> (cf. 37, A.2, note 7) > add.

'hetor anyānapekṣaṇāt 2.58b

## Appendix: Synopsis of the texts' edition and the folio-pages in the plates

text	pp. in the edition	data-nr.	folio nr. on plate	folio nr. on folio		remarks
<b>Pramānaviniścaya Chapter 1</b>	ed. Steinkellner 2007					
		086	128A?			Empty, but with discontinuing upside down <i>akṣara</i> from a page not identifiable
	1,1-2,11	097	128B	1b		
	2,12-3,13	098	131A			
	3,13-5,1	099	131B	2b		
	5,1-6,5	098	132A			
	6,5-7,?	099	132B	3b		
	7,11-9,4	064	61A			
	9,4-10,9	065	61B	4 <sup>3</sup> b		
	10,9-11,13	100	134A			
	11,13-13,5	101	134B	5b		
	13,5-14,9	100	135A			
	14,9-15,10	101	135B	6b		
	15,10-16,15	100	136A			
	16,15-18,3	101	136B	7b		
	18,3-19,8	102	137A			
	19,8-20,11	103	137B	8b		
	20,11-21,15	066	66A			
	21,15-23,2	067	66B	9b		
	23,3-24,4	066	67A			
	24,4-25,8	067	67B	10b		
	25,8-26,12	066	68A			
	26,13-28,7	067	68B	11b		
	28,7-29,12	068	69A			
	29,12-31,4	069	69B	12b		
	33,8-34,10	068	71A			
	34,10-35,12	069	71B	14b		
	38,6-40,1	070	73A			
	40,1-41,4	071	73B	16b		
	41,4-42,7	070	74A			





	91,8-92,12	076	88A			
	92,12-94,1	077	88B	38b		
	94,1-95,4	078	89A			
	95,4-96,6	081	89B	39b		
	96,6-97,6	078	90A			
	97,6-98,7	081	90B	40b		
	98,7-99,8	078	91A			
	99,8-100,11	081	91B	41b		
	100,11-101,12	078	92A		l.6: chapter-colophon	

## Bibliography

- Hugon & Tomabechi 2011 Pascale Hugon and Toru Tomabechi; *Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya. Chapter 3*. Critically edited. Beijing-Vienna 2011
- Pecchia 2014 Cristina Pecchia, A Discussion of Alex Watson's *The Self's Awareness of Itself*. With a Addendum About the Transmission of Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇaviniścaya*. *Rivista degli Studi Orientali*, nuova serie 87, 107-119
- Steinkellner 2008 E. Steinkellner: Miszellen zur erkenntnistheoretisch-logischen Schule des Buddhismus X: Corrigenda 2 et addenda to *Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya. Chapters 1 and 2*. Critically edited. Beijing-Vienna 2007. WZKS 51, 2007-2008, 207-208
- Steinkellner 2013 E. Steinkellner, *Dharmakīrtis frühe Logik. Annotierte Übersetzung der logischen Teile von Pramāṇavārttika I mit der Vṛtti*. 2 vols. (Studia Philologica Buddhica, Monograph Series 29a,b) Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies
- Steinkellner 2013a E. Steinkellner; Corrigenda 3 at addenda to *Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya. Chapters 1 and 2*. Critically edited. Beijing-Vienna 2007 (2.1.2013)  
[www.ikga.oeaw.ac.at/Mat/steinkellner07\\_corrigena.pdf](http://www.ikga.oeaw.ac.at/Mat/steinkellner07_corrigena.pdf)
- Steinkellner forthcoming E. Steinkellner, Analyse einer Sammelhandschrift von Werken Dharmakīrtis. In: Festschrift for John Taber